

# International Trade Agreements and Their Relation to Core Labor Standards

Shuhong Yu<sup>1</sup> & Malik Zia-ud-Din<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Labour and Social Security Institute, School of Law, Wuhan University, Wuhan, China

<sup>2</sup> School of Law, Wuhan University, Wuhan, China

Correspondence: Malik Zia-ud-Din, School of Law, Wuhan University, Wuhan, China. E-mail: malikziaudin@yahoo.com

Received: May 16, 2018

Accepted: July 13, 2018

Online Published: August 30, 2018

doi:10.5539/jpl.v11n3p33

URL: <https://doi.org/10.5539/jpl.v11n3p33>

*Research for this article was supported by the Ministry of Education, China, Youth Project of Humanities and Social Sciences (Project No. 17YJC820001).*

## Abstract

The research is an attempt to comprehend with these issues and enunciate an argument that international labor rights and labor standards are a pivotal component of international trade, investment, and development strategy for the well-being of the entire society not only for the wealthy nations. Section 1 of the paper lays out unanimity of labor rights and standards depicted from different sources with evoking instances showing real concerns that have originated with the development of new universal trade. Section 2 illustrates various forums where the international labor rights assertion perhaps induced, through a discourse of multiple supervision or enforcement mechanism available under such forums. Last part of the paper concludes the study and proposes future initiatives to labor rights advocates from all discussions and further recommends new allegiances to international fair labor rights and standards by government, employers, and trade unions entered into a global economy.

**Keywords:** labor rights, core labor standards, international trade, agreements

## 1. Introduction

The difference in labor rights and labor standards between the states at changing stages of development has elevated its prominence as an essential element particularly in international trade (Compa, 1993b). The justification of the existence of conventional rules and regulations of labor law is inevitable such as standard wages, occupation health, and safety regulations, maximum working hours, biased against a specific group, races or gender, and recognition of trade unions for collective bargaining (Collins, 2011). The relationship among international trade and labor standards have been recognized for hundred years; however, much effort has been made to declare this association through the multilateral or plurilateral system.

The nexus between international labor standards and the plurilateral trading system is unavoidable: global markets necessitate bulk production and supply chain, supplied by skilled, semi or unskilled workers around the globe. The authority and control over the value chain in the current production and marketing industry and strategies seems justified. The nexus between international trade and labours standards increased traction with the growth of low wage worldwide competitive producers primarily in Asia. Some analysts and economic experts criticise the import from low wage countries that have shifted manufacturing units as well as jobs opportunities in developed countries (Bakvis & McCoy, 2008). This has decreased the wage level of unskilled workers and caused higher unemployment and diminished economic growth. On the contrary, the mass production led by lower salaries has contributed to the corporate profitability and enabled mass consumption of the products that otherwise, would have been beyond the reach of the developed world (Aryada, 2016). While the espousal of common labor standards, it is proposed that core labor standards have to be implemented with a harmonious relationship between employers and employees, similarly, between public and private sector. Furthermore, fair and equal treatment of workers is more productive and brings positive changes in the social and economic well-being at large.

Indeed, non-compliance with the labor rights and standards has significant effect on the investment patterns. But

the questions begin from this discussion whether high standards and vigorous enforcement of labor rights same in trade and investments further decelerating down the economic development? Or the vigorous enforcement of workers' rights increases the value of purchasing power and political and economic stableness as well as encourages economic growth.

Mostly international investors seek to maximize their profits, long-lasting protection for the labor for their efficient use which induces distinction for the investment (Compa, 1993b); (Salem & Rozental, 2012). The pure market forces have some interfering factors including minimum wage, child labor rights and laws, occupational safety and health, job security and right to organizing union and collective bargaining. The multinational companies are inflicting outlays on these factors to compete with the global economy. However, investors establish that this cost can be minimized or avoided in such countries where labor rights and labor standards are either less stringent or low standard. Such nations turn into alluring targets for the new investors in respect of cost-saving production (Kucera, 2002).

Many companies shift their operations to the countries where they have favorable investment environment, low wages, weak unionization structure and less regularized industry due to rigorous labor standards. Such examples of movements can be found from developed countries to developing countries, however, in some cases, these movements occur between developed states to another, and also within developing countries. The best example of the shift of textile industry of Pakistan to Bangladesh due to cheap labor, the weak structure of labor unions, weak enforcement of labor laws and facilities for the textile sector (Azad, 2012). Similarly, Apple and other electronic companies already moved its production units to China due to cheap labor, weak labor union laws and enforcement (Blodget, 2012).

The proponents of the free market name this transfer advantageous which reflect the efficient use of labor. In many cases they even influence governments to ease burdensome labor regulations; therefore, such transfers can also promote and increase the efficiency in the production process (Compa, 1993b). On the one hand, it may create a disturbance for the affected workers and communities whereas, on the other side, in the long run, such transfers are beneficial more efficiently operated for a dynamic and fast-growing economy (Salem & Rozental, 2012).

Workers and workers unions have a different perspective on the connection of labor standards and trade. They consider that high salaries and constant social protection system merely exist in stable democracies and advanced economies, competent judiciaries, advanced infrastructure, skilled labor and a middle class with good purchasing power (Golub, 1997). In the end, these favorable considerations bring increased productivity and expansion in the international economy. Business class should consider these circumstances worthy in the wake of investment instead of running away from prosperous circumstances.

Deterioration or relaxation on labor standards for the sake of attracting Multinational Corporations can start a "*race to the bottom*" between the investing countries (Olney, 2013). Each investment receiving country decreases its labor costs for its workers as compared to its competitors and to encourage investment. However, weakening the competition is the only way to take advantage and gain more investment. Even the governments who want to raise labor standards or maintain the existing rules, receive severe threats from the companies to shut down its operations as a response and to move to those countries who have lower labor standards (Dunning & Lundan, 2008). Although, international standards exist, and all countries are bound to follow these rules, but many states are reluctant to impose new regulations, and cost on employers and mostly such nations decrease their labor standards to retain large employers in the country. While this cycle continues, it will hamper the buying power of the workers what they have produced, and it would further lead to the stagnation of economy slightly growth (Compa, 1993b).

The only resolution to this plight is strong enforcement of international labor rights and standards. This article explained in a view to an advocate of trade union not a proponent of the free market. Nevertheless, both statements are true. At an maximum level, high salaries don't have any link with the high productivity, strict social protection outstrip society's capability to render them, and impulsive limitations on the mobility of capital that halt the growth and productivity of the market. With the passage of time, the labor standards will be maintained by the multinational enterprises. At another extreme level, holding the wages less than the productivity growth, deterioration in the distribution of wealth to the society which can have substantial social security net and allowing the mobility of capital lacking the protection of labor stimulate the "*race to the bottom*" (Ghatak, 2010). The continuation of such policies may decelerate the growth and productivity while companies try to take advantages by "sweating" workers rather than acquainting new technology, new assembly line, advanced material, new marketing and services strategies, and product innovation. It's a huge challenge for the

policymakers from trade and development for the workers' rights to equilibrate on the increasing tendency of labor standards. The term "upward harmonization" was first coined and proposed by the European Community Social Charter for an agreement on labor standards with Northern American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) (Jackson, C. L. 1996).

Liberalization of trading system or policy is preferable instead of strict protectionism. Since the part of the trade liberalization policy, the wealthy countries should be restricted to realize that developing countries have advantage of their *relativity* of cheap labor force to appeal foreign investment considered as supports their plan to increase the subsisting standards of common population instead of earning profit for their elite class. The most important question raised up here is, relative to what? To the labor cost within bordering nations giving tough competition for the similar kind of investment? To the labor cost in developed nations that imported the products from the developing countries? What kind of productivity would lead to the fair share of profits? Or to identify and analyze the compliance of labor rights and labor standards which are necessary for the balanced trade flows, with factual human rights, wage discrimination, and exploitation at workplace?

This research study intends to grasp these issues and enunciate a stance of the enforcement of international labor rights and labor standards is an important element of strategy of development, trade and investment which will bring benefits for the entire society not for the industrial elite class or sector. Section 1 of the research paper draws unanimity between labor rights and labor standards through different references with the relevant example of its relationship that has been focused in the new age of international trade. Part 2 recapitulates the forums for the claim of international labor rights and discusses the different mistakes and enforcement mechanism furnished under these forums. The article proposes subsequent paces for labor rights proponents from the different forums in the conclusion part and suggests a new dedication with considering the new global economy for the international labor rights and labor standards by governments, employers and trade unions.

## 2. Fundamental International Labor Rights and Standards

International labor rights and standards have originated from International and regional human rights charters. International Labor Organization's conceptions and recommendations are other sources. It is believed that democratic countries have similar labor laws and practices. Both international and regional sources shape common general principles of labor rights and standards (Gernigon, Odero, & Guido, 2003). It can be different when it comes to the application of such rights. These basic rights include:

- Freedom of association, and right to form a trade union and bargain collectively with employers, and also be a part of civil and political affairs of society;
- Right of employment, the abolition of forced or compulsory employment;
- Protecting children from child labor and limitation on young labor;
- Equal opportunity and treatment in employment and occupation, without discrimination;
- Adequate salary package, working hours, social protection, healthcare, and occupational health and safety at workplace.

Increase in trade agreements and free market over the past few decades have revealed the occurrence and intensity of labor rights issues which affects the trade and investments trends (Global Employment Institute, 2015). The problem has not only experienced in connection with the flow of capital from developed to underdeveloped nations but also from developed to developed countries (Ibid: 25).

### 2.1 Freedom of Association and Right to Collective Bargaining

The right of association and bargain collectively is specified in all international human rights instruments; it's also a foundation of conventions of International Labor Organization (Assembly, 1948); (Assembly); (Assembly, 1966). Most of the countries have different economic and political system to regulating trade unions; this pattern has an intense effect on international trade and investment. For example, increase in trade unions rights and strikes shook Korea during the late 1980s, due to suppression of workers, the workers demanded a handsome share from the export regarding increase in salary (Ogle, 1990). The increase in wages resulted in cut stridently into Korean exports profits and instigated industrialist to move its businesses to Central America, Thailand, Malaysia, and other countries where labor cost and overall cost of production were relatively cheap.

Many countries deliberately make policies to restrict workers from organizing and bargaining collective to support their exporting industries that are significant to their growth. For example, Malaysian government forbids workers unions from organizing from its growing electronic industry (Compa, 1993b). Due to change in the labor policy, some multinational companies mainly from the United States of America threatened Malaysian

government to move its operations somewhere out of Malaysia (Ibid: 170). Simultaneously, the US Trade Representative has reckoned imposing trade penalties on Malaysia because of violating workers' rights.

Workers' rights violations in Pakistan aren't different than many other developing countries. Labor laws violations, child and bonded labor, minimum wage, over time and right to organize are prevalent (ShuHong & Zia-ud-Din, 2017). Many employees are fired illegally every year from their services for attempting organizing trade unions, while National Industrial Relations Commission is incapable to restrict employer's illegitimate maneuvers in organizing and bargain collectively (Ibid: 40). While the right to strike, form union have disappeared in the country by the use of permanent replacement of strike employees (ShuHong, Y. Zia-ud-Din, M. Ranjha, KM. 2017).

International Trade Union Confederation (ITUC) disclosed recently that the Federal and Provincial Governments in Pakistan have failed in providing rights to trade unions as enshrined in the constitution. Currently, the violation of their rights followed with four different cases registered against the Government of Pakistan in 2013 (ITUC, 2014); i) the leader of a trade union leader was assaulted during conciliation regarding wages, fringe benefits and job security with employer which arrived at deadlock; ii) around 400 young doctors were peacefully protesting against the health authorities to reinstate their 200 young doctors on their previous posts, they were forcefully dispersed and the government refused to reinstate 200 young doctors, as well as criminal cases were also launched against the protesters; iii) difficulty in acknowledgement of Collection Bargaining Agents (CBAs) as the labor department refused to recognize this trade union from the mining company; iv) illegitimate interference by the government agencies or employers during strike when police interfere in peaceful protest and denied bargaining (Ibid).

The common article 8(2) (b) of Industrial Relations Act (IRA), 2012 and Provincial Relations Acts (BIRA, KPIRA, PIRA and SIRA) put unnecessary formalities which exceptionally interrupt or substantially weaken the free establishment of trade unions. This same section of the Act specifies that no other trade union is entitled to register in the same establishment or industry where two or more trade unions are already registered unless it has twenty percent of its workers from the establishment or group of establishments or industry as their members (Industrial Relations Act 2012 Art. 8 (2) (b); Punjab Industrial Relations Act (PIRA) 2010 Art. 6 (2) (b); Sindh Industrial Relations Act (SIRA) 2013 Art. 6 (2) (b); Balochistan Industrial Relations Act (BIRA) 2012 Art. 6 (2) (b); Khyber Pakhtunkhwa). Moreover, section 6 of the IRA intends, the registration of any trade union is allowed in case of existence of two trade unions in an establishment (Industrial Relations Act (KPIRA) 2010 Art. 6 (2) (b)).

Section 27-B of the Banking Companies Ordinance of 1962 prohibits the likelihood of becoming a union employee as bank officer. Furthermore, the National Industrial Relation Commission (section 44(10) of the IRA), or the Labor Court (section 64(7) of the BIRA and SIRA, 60(7) of the KPIRA, and 56(7) of the PIRA), have the authority to prohibit a trade union office holder for an unexpired term from holding any trade union office immediately on the charges of violating its orders and stop the strike. It is pertinent to mention that many times commission has exercised its power and disqualify many trade union officers who were holding office.

The state has vested discretionary power to declare any establishment in "*essential services*" under which none of the workers are allowed to strike. Employees from state administration, government services, state enterprises such as oil and gas production, electricity generation and transmission, and state-owned airline and ports – all employees covered by the 1952 Essential Services Maintenance Act – are forbidden to go on strike. Likewise, export processing zones are also prohibited the right to strike (ShuHong & Zia-ud-Din, 2017).

## 2.2 Child Labor

International Labor Organization (ILO) conducted a study in 1992 and found out the existence of exploitative child labor is an increasing factor in the global trade. Child labor is more concentrated in handmade carpets industry in Pakistan, India and many Asian countries. The existence prompted the Congress to prohibit the import of such commodities (Child Labor Deterrence Act of 1993, § 613). During the recent years, media has shown the abusive child labor condition to the consumers in several countries and compelled producers to address child labor issue.

According to the latest Labor Force Survey in Pakistan, the labor force participation rate among 10 to 14 years of age was 10.6 percent in 2013-2014 (LFS, 2013-2014). In absolute figures, it meant 6.4 million child workers toiling in the country. Though the number was lower than reported in the previous survey (2012-2013) which indicated a presence of 6.8 million child workers, it was a serious indictment of a country where 6.4 million children of 10-14 years of age were out of school, deprived of childhood and toiling in agriculture, fisheries, transport, carpet weaving, food catering, motor garages, light industry and domestic services sectors.

In 1996, the International Labor Rights Fund, an activist group from America, initiated a campaign to educate the consumer and player to put pressure on Nike, Adidas, and other major soccer ball producers because their firms have outsourced from Pakistan which is using child labor (Elliott & Freeman, 2003). Many firms and trade associations, the International Federation of Football Association (FIFA), took the severe notice about the image of youngsters kicking the balls in developed countries are made of poorly managed child workers in Least Developed Countries (LDC's) which caused them to adopt a code of labor practice for all manufacturer of soccer ball carrying FIFA label. The FIFA code banned those football manufacturers who were involved in child labor and forced them to protect freedom of association and comply with the international labor laws and standards (Ibid: 114).

Similarly, Workers and labor rights activists directed attention towards child labor in Bangladeshi apparel production during the early 1990s. In 1992, the NBC television news programme *Dateline* ran a story pointing children in Bangladeshi clothing and textile industry destined for Wal-Mart (Hayes, 1992). Simultaneously, the American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations (AFL-CIO) pleaded the US government to defer Bangladesh's qualification for trade benefits under Generalized System of Preferences (GSP) programme because of the persistence of child labor.

### 2.3 Forced Labor

Bonded labor in China to manufacturing goods for US market and Tiananmen Square massacre, has been a central point for the US Congress opposing the most favored nations of China with US government (Chan, 2000). Similarly, the case of Child labor exposed by the media sparked public anger and demand for imposing of sanctions on Chinese products which are exported to the US (Chan, 1998). Most recently, a member of National Assembly of Pakistan has highlighted the issue of Chinese prisoners working at China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) Projects. These prisoners can be involved in criminal activities in Pakistan too. He also shows its concern that separate security arrangements have made for Chinese nationals/prisoners working on CPEC projects (Dawn, 2018; The Economic Times, 2018).

The scourge of debt bondage, a modern form of human slavery, continued to inflict miseries in 2015 on an estimated 2.6 million workers from agriculture sector and brick kilns in Pakistan (Malik, 2016). The political power of the landlords and brick kiln owners, poor implementation of laws and lack of documentation of debt repayments and the non-payment of minimum wage led to the continued prevalence of bonded labour. The workers under bondage fought to whatever extent they could to gain freedom.

### 2.4 Discrimination

The cases of discrimination based on race and color have been found and therefore, trade sanctions were imposed on South Africa. The discrimination against black South Africans produces Sullivan Principles in 1970s, an initiative to bind US companies through voluntarily assuming non-discriminatory practices in the subsidiaries operation in South Africa (Comprehensive Anti-Apartheid Act, 1986). The Gulf War has affected many Palestinian workers from the occupied territory by Israel discriminated the fundamental rights of labor, and poor working conditions and also many Palestinian workers sacked from their employment working in the oil fields in the Middle East by Saudi Arabian and Kuwaiti companies. The conflict between Chinese employer and local workers has intensely affected the workplace relationship in countries from East Asia.

The increase in the shift of "*global assembly line*" of the garment and electronics industries from developed countries to developing countries, whereas keeping the research and development and management control in developed nations (head offices) has resulted in the claim of extensive discrimination against women on the basis of gender in the assembly line of these factories. The job on assembly line needs sharp sightedness and dexterousness which associates with the qualities of women workers. Such qualities attached with the conviction that women in developing countries, which are often exploited, have the same respect as their authority gives to women in developed countries. Because most of them presume that they are unable to protect themselves from exploitation either in the name of hazardous working conditions or sexual harassment at workplace. Numerous jobs require being physically healthy; however, hazardous working conditions and job stress has weakened their eyesight and diminish their working skills (Sönmez, 2013). In developed countries which are considered to be a place of immigrants from Asia, Southern Europe, and African Countries had high demand on the labor force agenda in many developed European countries such as Germany, France, and Scandinavian countries for many years. Violent assaults and discrimination in these countries as well as in Gulf Countries have intensively existed for many years (Clarke, 2014).

Most recently European Union Bloc has expressed its concern on the right to secure GSP plus status of Pakistan. The continuity of GSP plus status depends on the member countries to comply with the policy of

implementation of specific conventions predominantly related to good governance, including labor laws and rights, human and minority rights, gender rights and fairness, climate change and protection of the environment for ensuring sustainable social and economic development of the country. To monitor the compliance status of these conventions, the EU has also devised a mechanism to assess the information provided by the beneficiary countries and dissatisfaction with which could lead to the withdrawal of the status (Jatoi, 2018). Response by the federal and provincial governments on the eve of religious festivals of minorities is commendable, nevertheless neglecting the pro-minority legislation Pakistan has to face difficulties while satisfying the EU. In addition to these commitments, the government, therefore, needs to seriously consider pro-minority legislation to show some progress in the domain of human and minority rights (The Express Tribune, 2018).

### *2.5 Minimum Wage, Working Hours and Occupational Health and Safety*

The fundamental issue in international trade and investment in present time surrounds minimum salary requirement, limitation on job hours, occupational health and safety at the workplace. Agency for International Development (AID) provides monetary assistance to Central American suggests attracting American business firms by focusing on dramatic competition on minimum wage and job standards. The leading example of negotiation on this issue recorded with hidden camera and microphone between the spokespersons from Honduras, El Salvador and Guatemala on underbidding during an AID sponsored trade and investment exhibition (Compa & Vogt, 2000). The following public upheaval turns into a considerable issue in 1992 during presidential campaign helped Bill Clinton to criticize the President Bush's economic policies.

Korean Government withstood enacting Minimum Wage Laws for many years; workers' rights advocates point out the decision was intentionally taken to increase investment and maximize profits by exporting in the wake of suppressing wages below the justified level for workers. The minimum wage policy considered being an essential factor causing workers strike and unionization campaign during the late 1980s that eventually increased wages, decreased profits and reduced exports (Shorrock, 2016). Long working hours are so constant at "global assembly line" operation throughout the developing countries which range from twelve to fourteen working hours, double shifts, working overnight or over time is so prevalent in developing countries. However, conflict over long working hours is not only persistent in developing countries. For example, an Electronic firm in France established an agreement with its workers to work 24 hours in three different shifts, and they also allowed women to work the night shift. The firm was prosecuted under the French Labor Laws because such work in the night was illegitimate because French labor law prohibits women from working the night shift. The company pleaded the case to move to the European Court of Justice from domestic courts, which later affirmed that the French prohibition against female workers at the night shift was unlawful and discrimination at the workplace and violates the European Council Directive. The court further permitted the company to remain its production schedule unchanged (Christèle, 1999).

Occupational health and safety at the workplace is one more problem for international labor which exclusively can influence the international trade and investment patterns. In the wake of such regulations, US Occupational Safety and Health Administration and the Environment Protection Agency together with the safety and environmental rules at the workplace in Mexico are considered to be essential factors in cross-border trade, manufacturing, and operations. The strikes and chaos in Korea were not only depended on wage suppression but also intentionally ignoring the worker's safety conditions at the workplace which further led to the turmoil in the 1980s by affecting the investment patterns across Asia (Compa, 1993a). In 1993, a fire incident at an export factory in Thailand shocked the world because of lack of necessary safeguards which left the highest death toll of any fire incident at a factory in history (Haines, 2003). A similar fire incident happened in a textile export factory in Karachi, Pakistan in 2012. The incident took 256 lives of workers, and around 55 workers were injured (Campaign, 2013). The incident is considered to be the most horrible and most significant industrial accident in the history of textile industry and worst facilities of Occupational Health and Safety at the workplace.

### **3. Origins of Labor Rights Claims and its Enforcement Regimes**

Labor rights demand appears in many business domains globally along with challenging difficulties in human rights, trade, and development policies and strategies. Numerous regulations, standards, codes of conduct, guiding strategies, and practical produce sources of law which raised by the aggrieved parties such as laborers, trade unions, employers, local communities, government and non-government organizations-making their right to assert and attempting for the enforcement before a competent forum to hear their charges. The part will review the different labor rights demands and spheres where they can raise these issues with a robust enforcement mechanism.

### 3.1 Multilateral Human Rights Instruments

The International Bill of Rights is the major source of labor rights globally along with United Nation's (UN) Universal Declaration of Human Rights combined with two more international covenants e.g., Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, and Civil and Political Rights (Compa, 1993b). Declaration of rights of association and unionization for collective bargaining, friendly employment working conditions and equal remuneration and proscription of forced or bonded labor, child labor, and any kind of discrimination are the components of The Bill of Rights (Ibid: 177).

The labor protection clauses equally imparted in the regional human rights agreements<sup>1</sup> (Donnelly, 2013). United Nations and Regional Organizations have given the opportunity to any aggrieved worker or labor union to consult these human rights commissions and courts against the labor rights violations (European Parliament, 2010). These courts and commissions are entitled to hear violations against human rights, whereas particular labor rights violations are generally sent to ILO.

### 3.2 ILO Conventions and Recommendations

The second main base of labor rights and standards is International Labor Organizations (ILO), and International Labor Code constitutes on the basis of its entire conventions and recommendations. The ILO created in 1919 after the restless efforts to form pan-European labor standards (Thomas, 1996). Several arrangements unanimously have been agreed on the prohibition of the use of white phosphorus in the manufacturing of matches and ban on night duty of women from the industry (Compa, 1993a). The World War I appalled the League of Nations, Government officials, Labor unions, and employers desired that such globally recognized labor standards might help to diminish the divergence between the member countries.

The ILO lasted the end of the League of Nations and commenced the formulation procedure of fair labor standards which later were named Conventions and Recommendations. ILO was suspended during the World War II but was reaffirmed in the Philadelphia Declaration 1944, while the war was about to finish, the governments, employers, and employees from the anti-Axis alliance optimistically desired that reincarnated commitments would help to develop fair labor standards and also help to avoid such international disaster in future (Dupré, 2016).

ILO is well recognized, capable and efficient authority to set and administer the international labor standards. The fundamental rights of ILO were adopted in 1998 and have contributed in formulating the foundation of wide range of voluntarily labor rights and standards particularly in the new age of global trade agreements. The pertinent question here is to analyze these trade agreements whether they address trade agreements and whether they have any impact on the trade patterns in the less wage and less developed countries (Alston, 2004). In the current scenario, ILO has effective authority to administer the international labor standards and recognize the importance of work in expanding income for the personal and country's development. It also identifies its positive effect which can enhance social and economic development. The ILO's *Fundamental principles and right at work and its follow-up* adopted in 1998, revisit the constitutional obligations specified in the following Conventions:

Convention Numbers	Description
29 and 105	Elimination of all forms of forced or obligatory labour
87 and 98	Liberty of association and the effective recognition of the right to collective bargaining
100 and 111	Elimination of discrimination concerning employment and profession
138 and 182	Effective abolition of child labour

The ILO is a well-recognized and specialized United Nations agency universally accredited and competent in labor matters (Valticos, 2013). The membership delegacy and decision making power distributed among the governments, labor unions and employers' representatives to ILO Conference (ILO, 1982). From numerous instruments, ILO gives dominance to the core conventions on human rights (Ratner, 2001). The core conventions guarantee employee and employer rights and right to organize and join establishment on their own will and continue their matter with any interruption from the government and protecting the right of the employees to organize and bargain collectively.

<sup>1</sup> Organization of American States, Organization of African Unity, and the European Community

Surprisingly, ILO doesn't have any enforcement powers neither it can compel any country or its member's states nor inflict any sanctions on the violations of such labor standards (Weissbrodt & Mason, 2013).<sup>2</sup> Instead, the strength of ILO's compliance with the issues of labor rights amongst member countries develops as of extended supervision role. Regardless, of the ratification of ILO's Core labor conventions, member countries need to present a report on its progress of compliance or incompliance to its national authorities and ILO. Member countries are expected to provide a report to ILO office and also react to the ailments of violations. In this regard, a committee comprises of Experts and Commission of Inquiry is designated to conduct inquiry in this regards and issue a report on the charges of serious violations of these conventions particularly regarding the right to organize, association and collective bargaining, forced and child labor allegations. Hence, compliance with the ILO conventions and recommendations can bring reforms through publicly embarrassing the violator.

### 3.3 Bilateral and Multilateral Trade Agreements

Mostly global business agreements contains clauses of labor with the subjective extent of specification and enforceability concerning to labor rights and standards. Trade agreements are regarded as a formal forum to encourage labor rights and standards. For instance, an agreement was signed by France and Italy during early 20<sup>th</sup> century concluded that pay and pension provided to those workers reciprocally against their work in the neighboring countries (Ramírez & Winkler, 2012). This agreement made Italy reiterate such amendments and retirement plans such as pension standards equal to available in France.

The European Community (EC) is highly efficient in developing labor rights as well as its enforcement. It also provides a legal option to the aggrieved parties to forward their case to European Commission and European Court of Justice. On the other hand, workers also have right to raise the issue to European Convention on Human Rights and make a petition to the European Court of Rights. The European Community has aimed a thorough "*social charter*" covering the broader concept of labor rights and standards in relations to European Economic Integration plan (Lukas, 2014). Though the United Kingdom rejected the suggestion which hindered the standard requirement to include the charter in Maastricht Treaty, it hasn't blocked the remaining members of EC to supplement the treaty by assuming the Protocol and Agreement charter.

North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) proposed the labor rights clause by noticing the example of European Social Charter (Gantz, Reetz, Aguilar-Alvarez, & Paulsson, 2011). The Bush Administration resisted letting in labor rights and standards during negotiation with NAFTA, they only negotiated trade agreements and neglected the social pact. However, the Clinton Administration reopened the negotiations and included labor and environment clauses "*side agreements*" with NAFTA (Hansen-Kuhn, 1997). The agreements on labor remain unsuccessful to win trade unions proponents because of its pro-NAFTA view and also by adding tri-national labor standards. Furthermore, its freedom to the right of association, organize and bargain collectively from its enforcement mechanism.

A connection between labor rights and standards and international trade agreements has been aimed to include in the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT) in several rounds of meetings and negotiations (Bakhshi & Kerr, 2009). Since the inception of GATT in 1948, the labor clauses included in the charter of International Trade Organization (ITO), which was later superseded by the General Agreement. Nonetheless, the US Congress refused to endorse membership and terminated ITO, disconnecting the link of labor rights clauses with GATT.

The Trans-Pacific Partnership Agreement (TPP) is a mega-regional Free Trade Agreement (FTA) under consultation and discussion among 12 countries. Currently, the total worth the members of TPP comprises of total GDP of US\$ 27.75 trillion, which is 37.5 percent of global economic output (The Straits Times, 2018). As long as the labor rights are concerned, the US considers that TPP can be {"*a unique opportunity to create the first enforceable standards for our new partners; to reform and modernize several of our existing agreements; and, ultimately, to set the foundations of a region-wide commitment to labor practices which meet international standards, ensure a level playing field for competition, and share the benefits of trade fairly.*"} (Aryada, 2016: 7)

Furthermore, labor rights amendments have included in different laws such as Generalized System of Preferences in 1984, the Overseas Private Investment Corporation in 1986, the Caribbean Basin Economic Recovery Act in 1986, the Trade Act of 1988, and the Agency of International Development (AID) funding or economic development grants for overseas in 1992 (Compa, 1993b). The amendments regarding labor rights stipulated in these statutes encompasses the right to organize, associate and bargain collectively, furthermore, it banned forced or bonded labor and prohibit child labor and set a minimum level of wages, working hours,

---

<sup>2</sup> The biggest example in this regard is United States of America because it has ratified only 11 ILO Conventions and only Convention No 105 from Core Labour Conventions. US senate approved in May 1991.

occupational health and safety of workers at workplace. Violation of these labor right and standards lead to unilaterally implementation of trade sanctions on the countries that violates.

### 3.4 *Voluntary Codes of Conduct*

Labor rights and labor standards code and conduct emanated in various contexts in international trade. These rights are encouraged by several non-governmental organizations to shape and change the classical behavior of multinational enterprises (Appiagyei-Atua, 2002). Some of the enterprises initiated as a result of national or foreign cooperation and some by individually<sup>3</sup> (Frey, 1997). A comprehensive set of code and conducts regulating labor rights are given by Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD), which is a coordinating authority of the developed industrial countries (Brown, 2000).

These codes and conducts allows workers to organize and enter an association for the collective bargaining and necessitate employer to provide better working conditions and services and provide useful information to the labor representatives needed for the significant negotiations. Furthermore, it need the corporation to provide complete information to worker representatives and give them permission to “*obtain a true and fair view*” regarding the performance of the corporation. In addition, it prohibits favoritism at the workplace, and obligates the employers to provide prior notice about layoffs and to cooperate with labor unions to minimize the effect of layoffs, and also bound the enterprises not to threaten to shut down or sift of operations, undue influence on negotiations, or to manipulate the right to organize (Gordon, 2001).

International Labor Organization (ILO) has also assumed code of conducts on the operations of multinational enterprises. Similar to OECD Guidelines, the ILO has set minimum standards that should be the fundamental right of every worker, promote, realize and respect the core labor standards, whether they have ratified these conventions or not. Though ILO declaration is a voluntary code for labor rights which doesn't have any enforcement power, it's for a private consultation or public assistance. These codes encompass the areas such as availability of jobs, investment and subcontracting with the local companies. The office has a specific complaint process under a Standing Committee on Multinational Enterprises; the committee is authorized to investigate the violations of labor code and standards by the companies (ILO, 2018).

### 3.5 *Litigation Strategies*

The proponents of fair labor standards and labor rights in international trade have contacted with US courts to justify the status of labor rights claims. Mix results have observed, various tribunals are hesitant and ingenious in litigation having international economic, cultural and political composite subtle. However, as a result of growing awareness about labor rights, business growth along with institutional efforts such kinds of cases are expected to increase.

Following to growing awareness about labor rights and standards, a Korean Labor Union filed a petition in US federal court which based in New York against a transnational corporation on violating the labor rights and standards which have mentioned in their agreement. They took the plea on the shutdown operations and moving to Taiwan in 1989. Around 300 workers lost their job out of them most were women because if it's abrupt shutdown. The workers were neither served one-month prior notice for the cancellation of their services nor were they given their salary for the final week of their work they performed.

Simultaneously, in September 2012, fire incident occurred in Baldia textile factory took the precious lives of 260 people, and 32 injured in Karachi, Pakistan (Campaign, 2013). The primary customer of the factory was KiK, a German clothing retail company. A survivor and 3 families of the victims filed a complaint at the regional court in Dortmund, Germany against KiK, arrogating that the company should take the fire incident responsibility in the Baldia textile factory, Karachi on 13<sup>th</sup> March 2015. The pray in the lawsuit was to compensate financially to the affected families as well as an apology because the company was supposed to ensure the safety at its outsourced clothing production facilities. The court maintained the jurisdiction and granted legal aid to the claimants on 30<sup>th</sup> August 2016 (Prentice, 2018). After the court verdict, KiK agreed to pay a total amount of \$5.15 million to the affected families and survivors following to a negotiation organized by the International Labor Organization (ILO) (Business and Human Right Resource Center, 2018). It was announced later, that according to the agreement facilitated by ILO, KiK would provide monthly pension to the families of the victims which will be starting in February 2018.

---

<sup>3</sup> Levi Strauss, Sears Roebuck, and other several other companies introduced labor rights and codes following abusive labor conditions of workers especially in Asia, which are supplying goods to those retailers.

#### 4. Conclusion

The difference between conditional or unconditional rights for example freedom of association, freedom from forced and bonded labor are entirely depends on the development of a country, that is minimum level of wage, minimum age for work, working hours and availability of facilities at workplace, presents a thorny problem for the proponents of labor rights. The erstwhile blatantly provide reasonable grounds for advocating the rights and criticizing on the practices of one country. Secondly, “rights” are entirely associated with the level of country’s development. Because highlighting these issues may increase the agitation of “*back-door protectionism*” which is, arguing labor rights considered to be a shield for obstructing exportations from less developed nations, because advocates are cognizant that these developing nations are unable to bear the hike in the labor cost.

The similar considerations restrain the contestation of export-led growth proponents. Indeed, there are some practices which cannot explicitly express as a vital element of business or development strategy. For instance, none of the countries would say that the economies will boost if they use forced labor or mild form of slavery and child labor. Perhaps, their answer will be in “no” that they are unable to increase the wage rates, working hours, or occupational health and safety at the workplace. Instead, they would call they follow a cloaked form of protectionism that is encouraged by labor rights and standards advocates. The labor rights advocates must coagulate the definition of international labor rights. As the development of international labor rights is highly recognized, it is imperative for the proponents to avoid *idessfixes* about the single or the better forum for treatment. This research can only sketch steps which further required the minimum consensus.

The advocates of the international fair labor standards should revisit human rights instruments and workers’ rights clauses as well as modus operandi of UN and the regional charter should obligate them to include labor clauses and issues. The only cases that meet the definition mentioned in the instrument or procedure should be selected carefully and taken to the courts and commissions of these plurilateral organizations.

International Labor Organization (ILO), European Community (EC) and several other nations exclusively formulated laws encompassing the right to organize, association and bargain collectively, right of peaceful strike and trade union characteristics and facilities (Ewing & Hendy, 2015). The proponents of international labor rights should consolidate these laws and decide these laws are universal and observe no country is permitted to derogate from such laws in the name of local traditions or economic development. The most eminent and potential challenge for the trade unions is to describe those labor rights which are exclusively considered as fundamental. Similar to civil or political rights which are unarguably acceptable for the society at substantial, the fundamental right of being free from anguish, or illogical detention and freedom of expressions and conscientious, workers’ rights such as, right to join an association, right to bargain collectively – must be unquestionable.

Within the range of incontestably universal human rights for instance right of association, exemption from slavery, forced or bonded labor, and torture etc. in contestable merely economic benefits such as minimum wages, working hours, paid leaves, maternity leaves, workers right to form and join labor union and participate in labor union activities such as striking, bargaining, participating in political legal activities and so on are considered and positioned on the socio economic side of the ledger instead of universally recognized side. It is worth mentioning that organizing, striking, bargaining and other trade union activities are merely a method of creating such requirements for a country or employer which is not capable of accepting them. For instance, if they refuse to recognize these fundamental demands, their refusal is not a violation of human rights. The government might enforce conditions to channelize worker activities in view to the policy given by the development strategy and policymakers which includes (incentives for foreign direct investment, selling on cheap prices compare to foreign competitors or developing emerging industries) or simply by increasing salary packages and benefits.

This view contains flaws because rights cannot be immortal as abstractions. The fundamental human rights cannot be assured in practice until and unless basic needs such as economic, political and cultural need have accomplished. If not, distressed action by the destitute people will evoke suppression by the government institutions in a continuous cycle of human rights abuse. The proponents of fair human and labor rights define that distribution of fair human and labor rights is the sole solution to this problem. Additionally, the advocates of labor rights consider this deliberation is considered to be a shield of self-assistance by the trade unions and expression of fundamental human rights. Fair employment policies, minimum wages, right of association, the right of bargaining collectively, peaceful strike or protest, political and other trade union activities must consider as fundamental rights, not a different benefit.

Many initiatives can be assumed to encourage circumstances of global reasonable standards of labor within multi-beneficial worldwide economy. For instance, labor rights advocates in the US should necessitate the

ratification of ILO human rights Conventions and the UN International Convention on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. Non-ratification of such conventions by the USA is undermining the use of independent trade standards particularly in addressing labor rights violations, similar to those of the Generalized System of Preferences and other US trade programmes.

Possibly bilateral and multilateral trade agreements are the most anticipating and contiguous domain for promoting workers' rights. In this regards, NAFTA took half initiative in the direction of labor side agreements in which it demonstrates the enforcement mechanism for the supposed violation of minimum or equal pay, child and bonded labor and occupational health and safety at workplace laws, furthermore, it establishes a supervisory and evaluation of mechanism for the enforcement of labor was and other issues such as association, organizing and bargaining collectively. As long as the trade agreement between USA and Mexico continue to function, the labor rights advocates will also continue to increase pressure on the USA on wages exploitation of Mexican workers.

The GATT can return to Havana Charter principles under which the organization had launched with new deliberations of labor right and standards as a clause for the liberalization of trade. Social and labor issues have been considered an essential element during the integration process of Europe. This integration finally contributed to the promulgation of "Community Charter of the Fundamental Social Rights of Workers" in 1989 lay out the extent and principles of labor issues in Europe encompassing minimum wage, improved working conditions, social protection, right to organize and bargain collectively and gender discrimination. Human Rights Advocates, unions, churches, consumer organization, and allies should require to the answerability of international organizations for the practice of fair labor laws in the subsidiaries across the globe. Sears, Levi Strauss have adopted new labor code which may instigate other multinationals enterprises to adopt new labor laws with extended reporting, labor" ombudspersons" and other innovative standards.

Generally, there should be a unilateral action against the plurilateral agreement on fair labor rights and standards. The US is susceptible when it take action against developing countries on labor rights grounds, by showing its hypocrisy (not ratifying key ILO conventions and human rights instruments) and "big power arrogance" (by using its economic power to dictate economic policies of small countries). On the contrary, these circumstances should not halt US activities. In the absence of multilateral consensus over fair workers' rights and standards, US can pursue other countries to defend its worker's rights as it is a significant feature in global trade. Therefore, labor rights proponents should evoke other countries to include labor clauses into their trade laws as intellectual property rights in US have develop into a foundation stone (Valdés & McCann, 2014). Additionally, workers, labor unions and labor rights activists from home and abroad country must extend modern litigation strategies to support legal initiatives, voluntary code of conducts, trade dialogues, and human rights solicitations. It is proposed that perhaps a *Filartiga-type* complaint alleging labor rights infraction as a violation of national laws.

The enforcement of fair labor rights and standard are still in the initial stages, it needs a rapid change to catch up the international economy, and it can exclusively start from multinational enterprises. A detailed definition of labor rights and standards is a complex phenomenon, intersecting human rights, labor rights, labor laws and policies and international trade. However, it has to carry out. In future, human rights theorists and proponents, analysts of trade and policy development and labor lawyers including scholars and law practitioners have to develop an international law by focusing on labor rights in international trade.

## References

- Alston, P. (2004). 'Core labour standards' and the transformation of the international labour rights regime. *European Journal of International Law*, 15(3), 457-521. <https://doi.org/10.1093/ejil/15.3.457>
- Appiagyei-Atua, K. (2002). Human rights NGOs and their role in the promotion and protection of rights in Africa. *International Journal on Minority and Group Rights*, 9(3), 265-289. <https://doi.org/10.1163/157181102763869168>
- Assembly, U. G. (1966). International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.
- Assembly, U. G. (1948). Universal declaration of human rights. *UN General Assembly*.
- Assembly, U. G. (1966). International covenant on civil and political rights. *United Nations, Treaty Series*, 999, 171.
- Azad, A. R. (2012). *Energy woes: over 40 percent of textile industry has shifted to Bangladesh?* Retrieved March 5, 2018, from <https://defence.pk/pdf/threads/over-40-percent-of-pakistans-textile-industry-has-shifted-to-bangladesh.207565>

- Bakhshi, S., & Kerr, W. A. (2009). Do Labour Standards Have a Role in International Trade? Private Standards, Preferential Trade Agreements Or the WTO.
- Bakvis, P., & McCoy, M. (2008). *Core labour standards and international organizations: what inroads has labour made?* Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung, Internat. Entwicklungszusammenarbeit, Globale Gewerkschaftspolitik.
- Blodget, H. (2012). *This Article Explains Why Apple Makes iPhones In China And Why The US Is Screwed*, *Business Insider*. Retrieved March 5, 2018, from <http://www.businessinsider.com/you-simply-must-read-this-article-that-explains-why-apple-makes-iphones-in-china-and-why-the-us-is-screwed-2012-1>
- Brown, D. K. (2000). International Trade and Core Labour Standards.
- Business and Human Right Resource Center. (2018). *KiK lawsuit (re Pakistan)*. Retrieved May 5, 2018, from <https://www.business-humanrights.org/en/kik-lawsuit-re-pakistan>
- Campaign, C. C. (2013). Fatal Fashion: Analysis of recent factory fires in Pakistan and Bangladesh.
- Chan, A. (1998). Labor standards and human rights: The case of Chinese workers under market socialism. *Human Rights Quarterly*, 20(4), 886-904. <https://doi.org/10.1353/hrq.1998.0036>
- Chan, A. (2000). Globalization, China's free (read bonded) labour market, and the Chinese trade unions. *Asia Pacific Business Review*, 6(3-4), 260-281. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13602380012331288562>
- Child Labor Deterrence Act of 1993.
- Christèle, M. (1999). *France and EU legal tussle over women's night work*. Retrieved May 4, 2018, from <https://www.eurofound.europa.eu/observatories/eurwork/articles/working-conditions/france-and-eu-in-legal-tussle-over-womens-night-work>
- Clarke, P. (2014). *The Middle East is the worst region for racial and nationality discrimination*. Retrieved March 28, 2018, from <https://news.efinancialcareers.com/us-en/184324/middle-east-worst-region-racial-nationality-discrimination>
- Collins, H. (2011). Theories of rights as justifications for labour law. *The idea of labour law*, 137-155.
- Compa, L. (1993a). International Labor Rights and the Sovereignty Question: NAFTA and Guatemala, Two Case Studies. *Am. UJ Int'l L. & Pol'y*, 9, 117.
- Compa, L. (1993b). Labor rights and labor standards in international trade. *Law & Pol'y Int'l Bus.*, 25, 165.
- Compa, L., & Vogt, J. S. (2000). Labor rights in the generalized system of preferences: A 20-year review. *Comp. Lab. L. & Pol'y J.*, 22, 199.
- Dawn News. (2018). *Chinese prisoners working on CPEC projects: MNA*. Retrieved March 10, 2018, from <https://www.dawn.com/news/1392023>
- Donnelly, J. (2013). *Universal human rights in theory and practice*. Cornell University Press.
- Dunning, J. H., & Lundan, S. M. (2008). *Multinational enterprises and the global economy*. Edward Elgar Publishing.
- Dupré, C. (2016). *The age of dignity: human rights and constitutionalism in Europe*. Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Elliott, K. A., & Freeman, R. B. (2003). *Can labor standards improve under globalization?* Peterson Institute Press: All Books.
- Estella, A. (2016). Emerging Disciplines on Labour Standards in Trade Agreements. *TCS Emerging Issues Briefing Note*, (4).
- Ewing, K. D., & Henty, Q. (2015). The Eclipse of the Rule of Law: Trade Union Rights and the EU.
- Frey, B. A. (1997). The legal and ethical responsibilities of transnational corporations in the protection of international human rights. *Minn. J. Global Trade*, 6, 153.
- Gantz, D. A., Reetz, C. R., Aguilar-Alvarez, G., & Paulsson, J. (2011). Labor Rights and Environmental Protection under NAFTA and Other US Free Trade Agreements [with Comments]. *The University of Miami Inter-American Law Review*, 42(2), 297-366.

- Gernigon, B., Odero, A., & Guido, A. (2003). *Fundamental Rights at Work and International Labour Standards*. Geneva: ILO. Retrieved May 22, 2015, from [http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\\_norm/---normes/documents/publication/wcms\\_087424.pdf](http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---normes/documents/publication/wcms_087424.pdf)
- Ghatak, A. (2010). Health, labour supply and wages: A critical review of literature. *The Indian Economic Journal*, 57(4), 118-143. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0019466220100408>
- Global Employment Institute, (2015). International Labour Standards in the Contemporary Global Economy
- Golub, M. S. S. (1997). *International labor standards and international trade*. International Monetary Fund.
- Gordon, K. (2001). The OECD guidelines and other corporate responsibility instruments.
- Haines, F. (2003). Regulatory reform in light of regulatory character: Assessing industrial safety change in the aftermath of the Kader Toy Factory fire in Bangkok, Thailand. *Social & Legal Studies*, 12(4), 461-487. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0964663903012004003>
- Hansen-Kuhn, K. (1997). Clinton, NAFTA and the Politics of US Trade. *NACLA Report on the Americas*, 31(2), 22-26. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10714839.1997.11722798>
- Hayes, T. (1992). Wal-Mart disputes report on labor. *The New York Times*. Retrieved February, 28, 2014.
- ILO. (2018). *Governing Body – Subcommittee on Multinational Enterprises*. Retrieved May 2, 2018, from [http://www.ilo.org/empent/Informationresources/WCMS\\_101252/lang--en/index.htm](http://www.ilo.org/empent/Informationresources/WCMS_101252/lang--en/index.htm)
- ITUC. (2014). *Survey of violation of Trade Unions Rights*. Retrieved March 6, 2018, from <http://survey.ituc-csi.org/Pakistan.html#tabs-2>
- Jackson, C. J. (1996). The Free Trade Agreement of the Americas and Legal Harmonization. *The American Society of International Law*, 1(3).
- Jatoi, S. (2018). *GSP plus, and minority rights*. Retrieved March 28, 2018, from <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1604491/6-gsp-plus-minority-rights/>
- Kuera, D. (2002). Core labour standards and foreign direct investment. *International Labour Review*, 141(1-2), 31-69. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1564-913X.2002.tb00230.x>
- Lukas, K. (2014). The Collective Complaint Procedure of the European Social Charter: Some Lessons for the EU? *Legal Issues of Economic Integration*, 41(3), 275-288.
- Malik, N. (2016). Bonded Labour in Pakistan. *Advances in Anthropology*, 6(04), 127. <https://doi.org/10.4236/aa.2016.64012>
- Ogle, G. E. (1990). *South Korea: Dissent within the economic miracle*. Zed Books.
- Olney, W. W. (2013). A race to the bottom? Employment protection and foreign direct investment. *Journal of International Economics*, 91(2), 191-203. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jinteco.2013.08.003>
- Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, Labour Force Survey, 2013-2014.
- Prentice, R. (2018). Workers' right to compensation after garment factory disasters: making rights a reality.
- Ramírez, M., & Winkler, A. (2012). *Information services for cross-border workers in European border regions*. Gronau: Association of European Border Regions.
- Ratner, S. R. (2001). Corporations and human rights: a theory of legal responsibility. *The Yale Law Journal*, 111(3), 443-545. <https://doi.org/10.2307/797542>
- Salem, S., & Rozental, F. (2012). Labor standards and trade: A review of recent empirical evidence. *J. Int'l Com. & Econ.*, 4, 63.
- Shorrock, T. (2016). *Korean Workers Launch Major Wave of Strikes, Winning International Support, In These Times*. Retrieved May 4, 2018, from [http://inthesetimes.com/working/entry/19558/korean\\_workers\\_launch\\_major\\_wave\\_of\\_strikes\\_winning\\_international\\_support](http://inthesetimes.com/working/entry/19558/korean_workers_launch_major_wave_of_strikes_winning_international_support)
- ShuHong, Y., & Zia-ud-Din, M. (2017). Questioni di diritto del lavoro in Pakistan: il fondamento storico della legislazione lavoristica e delle associazioni sindacali. *Labour & Law Issues*, 3(2), 21-54.
- ShuHong, Y., Zia-ud-Din, M., & Ranjha, K. M. (2017). Social Protection Schemes in Pakistan: assessment of existing programs. *Academic Journal of Business. Administration, Law and Social Sciences*, 3(2).

- Sönmez, A. (2013). Multinational Companies, Knowledge and Technology Transfer: Theoretical Framework. *Multinational Companies, Knowledge and Technology Transfer* (pp. 9-61): Springer. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-02033-4\\_2](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-02033-4_2)
- The Express Tribune. (2018). Pakistan wins EU praise for meeting GSP Plus criteria. Retrieved March 28, 2018, from <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1640084/1-european-parliament-lauds-pakistans-implementation-core-conventions/>
- Thomas, A. (1996). The International Labour Organisation-Its Origins, Development and Future. *Int'l Lab. Rev.*, 135, 261.
- Valdés, R., & McCann, M. (2014). Intellectual property provisions in regional trade agreements: revision and update.
- Valticos, N. (2013). *International labour law*. Springer Science & Business Media.
- Weissbrodt, D., & Mason, M. (2013). Compliance of the United States with International Labor Law. *Minn. L. Rev.*, 98, 1842.

### Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).