

# Understanding Professional Identity Through Pedagogical love: A Case of a Mentoring Dyad in Turkey

Gokcen Seyra Cakir<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Marmara University, Istanbul, Turkey

Correspondence: Gokcen Seyra Cakir, Marmara University, Istanbul, Turkey.

Received: June 14, 2023

Accepted: May 17, 2024

Online Published: October 21, 2024

doi:10.5539/jel.v13n6p296

URL: <https://doi.org/10.5539/jel.v13n6p296>

## Abstract

In this article, how a mentee's developing professional identity is reflected in the use of pedagogical strategies is explored through the mentor teacher's lens. Although mentoring relationships have traditionally focused on improving mentee teachers' teaching repertoire, unstructured affective processes involved as a result of the mentoring relationship have received limited attention. As being mentored to teach is intrinsically an effective process, this study situates the mentee's use of pedagogical strategies as a reflection of the developing professional identity within the pedagogy of love framework. Within the scope of the framework, how the mentee teacher utilizes her understanding of the pedagogical authority of the mentor teacher to develop her professional identity is reflected in the transformational role of pedagogical love. The mentee teacher steps into a self-actualization journey in which empathy, building trusting platforms for learning, and developing novice teacher intuition during the novel pedagogical encounters take precedence.

**Keywords:** professional identity, mentoring, pedagogical love, teacher education

## 1. Introduction

Across all TALIS participating countries, there is a trend of employing mentoring practices as a tool for bolstering novice teachers' emerging competencies (OECD, 2014). Support for novice teachers is seen as central to reducing teacher attrition. Although the development of the pedagogical repertoire of novice teachers is the target aim for the majority of the mentoring programs, there is no significant relationship between these programs and novice teachers obtaining feedback on their teaching practices according to TALIS findings (OECD, 2014). Turkey's teacher induction program, in contrast, relies heavily on reflections on the teaching practices of novice teachers. Exploring programs that concentrate on providing meaningful feedback on pedagogical strategies used by novice teachers paves the way for creating more practice-guided mentoring programs.

Acknowledging individual differences of novice teachers requires mentoring practices tailored to the needs of the novice teachers. Strategies to achieve this end involve scaffolding tasks based on novice teachers' competencies, catering to the emotional needs of the novice teachers, and engaging in pedagogical dialogue that is compatible with the novice teacher's understanding of reflective practices (van Ginkel et al., 2016). Recognizing the mentor's stance, then, is central to guiding novice teachers to reach their potential in the teaching profession.

Achieving self-actualization in teaching is concerned with addressing the emotional dimension of teaching. The best professional self a novice can construct equally requires investing emotionally in the teaching profession. Thus it is not surprising that moving beyond the technical competencies, quality in teaching is associated with feelings of love for teaching and the individuals involved in the process (Bullough & Pinnegar, 2009).

Although the central position of the emotional needs of individual novice teachers is recognized in the mentoring literature, there is limited research that explores the role of pedagogical strategies about pedagogical love in professional identity construction. This study situates the professional identity construction process of novice teachers within the community of practice as coined by Wenger (1998). Through the lens of a mentor teacher, the mentee's use of pedagogical strategies that shape the development of professional identity is interpreted with reference to Määttä and Uusiautti's (2012, 2013) pedagogical love.

## 2. Literature Review

### 2.1 *Mentoring and Professional Identity*

The dynamic nature of mentoring renders an attempt at an exact definition futile. However, traditionally mentoring involves a practice in which an individual with more experience engages in activities with another individual to aid professional and personal growth (Fernández-Cano et al., 2012). In educational contexts, mentors' area of responsibility falls in the spheres of planning and evaluation of the teaching activity of novice teachers. Mentors also provide socio-emotional support to mentees while engaging in activities that facilitate novice teachers' "integration into the education system" (Schatz-Oppenheimer, 2017). In a review of empirical research on effective mentoring practices for novice teachers (Crutcher & Naseem, 2016), it is shown that effective mentoring practices involve a sensitivity towards the needs of novice teachers while employing collaborative practices. Providing meaningful feedback coupled with critical reflection are also pillars of an effective mentoring process (Crutcher & Naseem, 2016). Mentoring is marked by its emphasis on building trusting relationships during which the mentor presents a positive mental model for the teaching profession discourse (Fernández-Cano et al., 2012).

Even before novice teachers embark on the actual teaching journey, personal development is a component of the meaning system shaped by the emerging professional identity. Early experiences of students in a teacher education program draw attention to the notion of teaching conceptualized as a self-realization journey that is charged with a sense of mission and purpose that is the essence of personal growth (Ezer et al., 2010). The duality of the personal and the professional is transformed into a single reflexive process in the formation of the professional identity of teachers. Interrelations between the personal and professional dimensions of identity require the conceptual constituents of professional identity to include the actions, values, and the "becoming" process of a teacher (Beauchamp & Thomas, 2009). While these processes are documented in teacher education literature, a certain portion of teacher education programs lack explicit attention to these processes (Beauchamp & Thomas, 2009).

Novice teachers come with a schema of what the teaching profession entails.

Real-life experiences may not comply with the early schema inexperienced teachers have developed. The task student teachers geared towards shifted from subject matter to classroom management when they engaged with actual teaching practice (Lamote & Engels, 2010). Real-life experiences may not comply with the early schema inexperienced teachers have developed. The task student teachers geared towards shifted from subject matter to classroom management when they engaged with actual teaching practice (Lamote & Engels, 2010). How they come to terms with the mismatching elements of their schema and what they face in reality influences their drive to commit to the teaching profession (Canrinus et al., 2011). Furthermore, novice teachers have reported that the initial strain they experience while forming their professional identity may arise from "conflicting conceptions of learning to teach" (Pillen et al., 2013).

There is evidence that components of the teachers' professional identity are related to the teachers' general pedagogical beliefs. Specifically, pedagogical belief in the direct transmission of subject matter is associated with an identity that is based upon the area of expertise (Berger & Lê Van, 2019). It is imperative to explore the developing professional identity concerning the pedagogical strategies that are used within the classroom.

Gilles, Wang, Fish and Stegall (2018) show that principals select mentors based on their competence in "translating practice to a novice". The teaching profession is abounded by incremental progressions in teaching practices and methods. While keeping up with these advances, teachers voluntarily assume the role of the learner which facilitates the reconstruction of the professional identity and "its meaning systems" (Han, 2017). Mentors are also tasked with the relational aspect of the teaching profession with an emphasis on engaging in dynamics of proportional learning dialogue with the novice teacher (de Paor, 2019).

How mentor teachers aid in the development of the professional identity of novice teachers is reflected in the mentoring strategies they use in practice. Although there are a plethora of mentoring programs that appear to promote dynamic learning for both mentors and mentees, there is evidence that mentor teachers are reluctant to use what is new or lose sight of new developments while relying on practices that inculcate the established into beginning teachers (Chu, 2019). Commonly used practices such as co-teaching strategies in the classroom is an area that requires further inspection (Chu, 2019).

Novice teachers' initiation into the teaching profession is facilitated in mentoring relationships as they practice being part of a community of practice. Wenger et al. (2002) communicate the ways communities of practice differ from teams and similar structures of organizations. It is the living texture of the interwoven interactions between individuals that evokes a spirit of wholeness in togetherness. Communities of practice as seen in the teaching profession are marked by their incremental progression through evolutionary changes in the community rather

than structured modifications (Wenger et al., 2002). Mentoring dyads as the first individual networks within the community of practice shape the natural progression of the novice teacher's alignment with these organic changes.

### *2.2 Mentoring and Pedagogical Love*

Although retaining quality teachers in the teaching profession has been one of the points emphasized in policy briefs, it hasn't been an easy task to pinpoint the way to achieve this goal. The majority of programs initiated to address this problem engage in extrinsically rewarding practices. While extrinsic motivation affects the decision to stay in any profession, teaching is specifically intrinsic at its core. It is concerned with understanding and shaping human nature to find ways to equip individuals with tools to survive in the larger context. Emotions play a vital role in creating a sense of community (Crawford, 2007). Thus, enabling programs that provide enriching emotional experiences for novice teachers to ease their transition into their teaching role is paramount. Just as mentoring is one way of building bonds with the established norms and individuals in education, it is also the facilitator of maintaining the drive to stay in teaching.

In this light, mentoring underscores how developing meaningful emotional experiences can help with maintaining novice teachers' drive to teach. Inspiring novice teachers to center their pedagogical strategies to improve learning also requires inspiration on the mentors' part. As such, studies show that it is the affective dimension of education that drives the school context. It is shown that the virtue of employing empathy in situations that require forgiveness and understanding is a daily occurrence (Loremann, 2011). Love as part of the affective dimension of mentoring has not been addressed adequately although pedagogical love as a strong influence on teaching has been acknowledged in teacher-student relationships (Loremann, 2011).

What it means to be a teacher is closely linked with empowering individuals to develop skills and knowledge to advance the progress of humanity which can be achieved through instilling revolutionary love for humanity (Johnson, Bryan, & Boutte, 2019; Douglas & Nganga, 2015). Creating spaces of love requires flourishing experiences that trigger sparks while facing the reality of classrooms and maintaining the stamina to learn new skills and knowledge. Pedagogical love, in the mentoring context, is concerned with building trusting relationships which leads to the awakening and collaborative construction of novice teachers' teacher-self.

Developing curriculum-based pedagogical strategies implies a degree of expertise in the teaching profession. Mentors through expertise in the subject matter establish a sense of "expert authority" as they gain respect for this process. Through a spectrum ranging from external authority which acknowledges being part of the dominant discourse to professional flexibility which requires the recognition of many professional selves in the discourse, mentors engage in practices that model multiple teacher selves ready to be "chosen and modified" by the mentee (Maatta & Uusiautti, 2012). Building pedagogical interactions that rest upon feelings of trust and ethics is one of establishing expert authority. Democratic creation of school norms coupled with respect for the values of the school community also communicates the notion of expert authority (Harjunen, 2009). This complex dialogue is specifically difficult to maintain for novice teachers due to the initial confusion of the transitional phase in which the novice teacher is not yet accustomed to the teacher role. Although novice teachers do not always prove to be assertive in making pedagogical decisions as equal educators in mentoring practices (Payne, 2018), mentoring is one way of encouraging novice teachers to contemplate how they can establish expert authority authentically. In this case, love acts as a facilitator of teacher self-transformation through guided actions. Moving beyond transitory feelings of initial excitement for the teaching profession, love, in the mentoring context, is a combination of guided pedagogical risk-taking, and strategy-building process.

Although mentoring is mechanical in one-on-one structured traditional programs, the way it models a teacher's self is based upon human emotions. Emotions of love create a sense of community. As Loreman (2011) indicates, cohesion in the school community is maintained through acceptance and feelings of trust amongst networks of loving relationships. The studies show that teaching performance is linked with emotional support through social bonds as well as peer trust (Liou et al., 2017). Similarly democratic mentoring practices may instill a sense of how democratic teaching practices may emerge which enables a sense of community within the school context (Payne, 2018). Furthermore, during times of conflict between the institution and the individual maintaining strong interpersonal relationships ensures that individual agency in the institutional context is preserved (Ye & Zhao, 2019). Novice teachers develop resilience through creating new bonds with their students and colleagues. It is through the creation of intimacy that novice teachers persevere and considers stress as an incentive to be limitless in their endeavours (Huisman et al., 2010).

### *2.3 Teacher Induction Programme in Turkey*

Turkey's Teacher Induction Programme offers a collaborative platform in which mentors, inspectors, and principals support novice teachers' transition to their teacher role (OECD, 2020). The mission of the teaching

profession within the Turkish context and what it entails for the development of a sense of belonging and commitment to the teaching profession is the main focus of the program (MEB, 2016). Novice teachers engage in practices that drive them to construct a professional identity that is meaningful to their teaching self and the larger learning community. The process to achieve these aims involves both school-based and community-based practices. It is, thus, a program that considers professional identity as part of an organic set of dynamics, which renders the duality between the individual school and the school environment obsolete.

The program involves a spiral of national, moral, humanitarian, and cultural values encompassing the technical competencies of pedagogical strategies including teaching knowledge and skills (MEB, 2016). The mentors are expected to guide novice teachers into the teaching community by instilling in them the values of the teaching profession without losing sight of international developments. Novice teachers are tasked with reflecting upon the ways values influence individual outcomes and they are given a series of seminars, which underscore the harmony between emotions, thoughts, and behavior (MEB, 2016). The program, thus, integrates the cognitive dimension with the affective dimension of teaching. In this light, the assigned mentoring dyad works collaboratively for the completion of the required activities with the support of the principal and the provincial directorates of education where required.

The school-based mentoring activities include planning sessions, class observations, teaching sessions, and the preparation of assessment materials. Novice teachers as mentees are also given a series of seminars where they develop reflective thinking skills in teaching while learning about the history of the teaching profession. Mentors reflect upon mentees' progress by filling out observation and activity forms. Novice teachers also observe classes of teachers other than those of mentor teachers and they are encouraged to share their experiences with other novice teachers in the region (MEB, 2016).

Mentor teachers also support mentees' out-of-school activities. Mentees are encouraged to engage in observations and visits to the museum of the region for educational purposes. As part of the program, mentees learn from experience, and meetings with retired teachers are also arranged to improve informal professional learning (MEB, 2016). While acting as gatekeepers of the teaching profession, mentors are provided with the opportunity to engage in "peer" development with mentees through the program. Within the scope of the program, this study explores the following research questions:

What are the pedagogical strategies that contribute to novice teacher's professional identity development through the lens of a mentor?

How does pedagogical love contribute to the formation of the professional identity of a novice teacher through pedagogical strategies?

### 3. Methods

Being a bridge between the East and the West, the educational scene in Turkey requires a holistic approach to teacher education as the demands to cater to culturally diverse groups of students are high. While beginning teachers are bound with rigid compliance to state standards, they are also expected to address the socio-emotional needs of students with different cultural backgrounds. The high school in which the mentoring dyad was placed is situated in the northwestern region of Turkey which is known for a large population of bicultural students whose families come from Balkan countries to settle in Turkey. Indeed, Bulgarian authorities have resolved 250000 Bulgarian citizens of Turkish origin to leave Bulgaria to seek resettlement in Turkey during the period 1950–1953. The influx of incoming population continued up until the early 1990s (Sharlamanov & Jovanoski, 2016). The multifaceted nature of teacher induction in Turkey, thus, aims to instill teaching values that acknowledge cultural diversity while developing a sense of professional identity in the teaching profession (MEB, 2016). In line with the scope of the teacher induction program, this descriptive case study explored the interaction of a mentoring dyad as the unit of analysis to understand the development of the professional identity of the novice teacher mentor teacher through the lens of the mentor teacher further.

The descriptive case study method was adopted as it offers a rich way of delineating "the natural experiences acquired in ordinary personal involvement" to add to our understanding of the meaning within the network of interactions that contribute to the phenomenon of professional identity (Stake, 2009). The mentor and the mentee were assigned to each other as part of the Teacher Induction Programme based upon the recommendation of the district directorate of national education. They were not in contact until after they were introduced to each other as part of the program. Their roles were framed as a teacher candidate and consulting teacher by the Turkish state regulations while the roles of mentor and mentee were also used informally in schools.

The mentor teacher was a 57-year-old chemistry teacher who had been teaching for 25 years at the start of the

Teacher Induction Programme. He held teaching posts in different regions of Turkey but was new to the mentor role he was placed in. The mentee was a 22-year-old recent college graduate who was assigned to the mandatory teacher induction program. She received her teaching qualification from a reputable university in Turkey. She had not been involved in any other mentoring activity before.

The initial formal frame set by the Directorate of National Education transformed their pedagogical communication into a naturally developing mentoring relationship.

This descriptive case study utilizes several forms of evidence including class observation, reflective documents provided by the mentoring dyad, and an interview with the mentor teacher to aid the interpretation of the data (Yin, 2009). During the academic year 2016–2017, a videotape of the duration of a class hour was recorded to observe the classroom interaction of the mentoring dyad. The focus of the observation was on the formation of the professional identity of the mentee through pedagogical strategies about pedagogical love. As part of the state framework set for the teacher induction program, the mentor teacher and the mentee formally reflected upon the classroom activities as well as the support system within the school in which the mentee was placed.

Since the mentor teacher's perspective has been the focus of the case study, an interview with the mentor teacher has been recorded to aid the interpretation of the reflective forms prepared by the mentoring dyad. The interview script has been shared with the mentor teacher to corroborate the themes. Brookfield's (2009) notion of reflection and critical reflection is adapted for the analysis of the reflection forms provided by the mentoring dyad. Brookfield (2009) lists four interconnected phases of reflection and explores the differing processes involved in critical reflection. The first phase of reflection involves understanding underlying assumptions conveyed by linguistic systems and behavior. Secondly, an effective assessment of the context and occurrences rests upon the close inspection of the evidence at hand. It is imperative to explore possible future scenarios our actions based upon our assumptions may bring about in educational processes. In addition, a multifaceted examination of the actions is required to reveal assumptions that haven't been uncovered yet. Critical reflection extending this dialogue incorporates the influence of power discourse in meaning systems (Brookfield, 2009). Using these steps as interrelated themes the interview data and reflection forms have been analyzed by first uncovering codes that can be grouped under themes related to the use of linguistic systems, mutual engagement in pedagogical authority, and collective capacity-building processes at school which connotes a sense of pedagogical love in the development of professional identity formation of mentee.

#### 4. Results

##### *4.1 Forming Dialogue Through Mutual Love for the Teaching Profession*

The formal state framework was devoid of any informal personal touch while it was rich in pedagogical assessment of the novice teacher's progress in the teaching profession. Still, it was "the personality of the involved individuals that possibly changed the pedagogical relationship" (Kenklies, 2019). The formal dialogue initiated by the state framework blossomed into a pedagogical dialogue that was guided by the personal touch of the mentor teacher and the novice teacher. Transformation of pedagogical knowledge through mentoring requires reinterpretation of it through language (Barnes, 1976). Adopting a similar stance, the mentor teacher utilized a mentee-focused language to acknowledge the development of the professional identity of the mentee teacher. Specifically, he connected the mentee's actions with the developmental processes instead of focusing on the mentor-directed "I" statements.

Mentor teachers linked the teaching profession with developing a network of constructive interactions with students. He situates the teaching profession within the larger network of meaning negotiation in which involved individuals partake in roles in constructing and embracing meaning (Wenger, 1998). Mentor teachers similarly emphasized the bonding between the teacher and the student as the first step before moving on to the subject matter. The individualized attention given to students appears to form a platform where students could share their cognitive resources freely which will be a starting point for the collective construction of meaning with their peers. Such an understanding of professional identity was also manifest in his descriptions of mentee teacher's use of teaching activities about student responses:

"A teacher should tap on the students' responses while explaining different concepts. The mentee always greeted students by calling their names and when she introduced a concept she asked a couple of warm-up questions regarding the states of matter: What do you understand when I mention: liquid, gas, and solid? She constructed her course based on the student's responses"

Taking a "flexible professional" stance towards teaching enables teachers to tune into supportive practices that scaffold teaching material based on student needs and meaning-making systems (Maatta & Uusiautti, 2012).

Following this line of thought, the mentee teacher indicated that the student-teacher interaction determined the flow of the course.

#### *4.2 Developing Pedagogical Authority*

While the professional self of the mentor teacher communicated “pedagogical authority” which instilled a sense of respect for the subject matter and intellectual growth, the pedagogical dialogue between the mentor teacher and the mentee teacher presented a consolidation of power which is shared by the mentee’s developing professional self. Co-creation of pedagogical strategies requires a dialogic relationship (Maatta & Uusiautti, 2012). Although the mentee-focused language used by the mentor teacher was transformed into a student-focused discourse in the novice teacher’s classroom through the dynamic pedagogical dialogue between the mentor teacher and the mentee, this pedagogical relationship was not meant to form a professional identity that was derivative. Indeed, the mentor teacher and the mentee didn’t aim to be imitative of each other but rather they thrived to enhance the dynamic process that shapes the pedagogical growth of professional identities that come together.

Acknowledging the mentee teacher’s emerging pedagogical repertoire appeared to strengthen the mentee’s trust in both her teacher role and her students. There is evidence that teachers’ trust in their colleagues is linked with trust shown to students (Tschannen-Moran, 2014). Similarly, the mentee adopted a stance that showed trust for student needs directing the flow of the course in her classroom. Pedagogical love is reflected in the way teachers show trust that students can engage in the construction of meaning indicating ownership of their learning (Määttä & Uusiautti, 2013). As stated by the mentor teacher, the mentee teacher’s introduction of the states of the matter encompassed a collection of relevant questions regarding the subject matter based on student responses. Each student came up with a question that they deemed important based on their understanding of the subject matter. Trusting students’ critical thinking skills while forming the question pool, the mentee teacher used this collection of student questions as the ultimate assessment method in which students asked each other a sample question from the pool of questions to check their understanding of the concept.

Mentee teachers’ understanding of the philosophy of teaching centered the student at the heart of the lesson planning. She relied on activities that emphasize student-student interaction as well as teacher-student interaction. It is pedagogical love that guides and perseveres the determination to fulfill the goals (Määttä & Uusiautti, 2013). The mentor teacher describes the mentee teacher’s use of student interaction as a learning activity. By asking students to form groups and adopt one variable from the subject matter introduced in class as the name of the group, the mentee teacher let students see interactions between these groups to match with their theoretical counterparts.

She acknowledges that instead of using a textbook she frequently relies on students’ daily life experiences as the main ingredient of her lesson plan:

“After I introduced the Boyle-Mariotte, Charles, Avogadro, and Gay-Lussac laws using 3D animations.... I tried to help them uncover what these theories mean for them in their daily lives... At the end of the lesson, I asked what contracting the bends means for a swimmer and I let them associate the relevant law with the bends.”

Her use of real-life examples in the classroom context is also used as an encouraging mentoring activity by the mentor teacher. The mentor teacher took on the role of the learner in the mentee teacher’s teaching sessions and through his Socratic question-answer approach he nudged the mentee teacher to use more real-life examples to engage students. While the mentee teacher used her developing teaching intuition to guide her lessons, the mentor teacher guided her to complement it with the teaching areas where she needed to stress. The mentor teacher indicates that he “asked her to stress how molecular mass of elemental gases such as hydrogen (H<sub>2</sub>), nitrogen (N) and revise it regularly in class.”

The pedagogical authority shown by the mentor teacher coupled with his trust in the novice teacher’s developing professional intuition facilitates the novice teacher’s building her repertoire of pedagogical strategies.

#### *4.3 From Individual Empathy to School Community Mentoring*

The mentor teacher’s description of the mentee teacher’s use of technology in her teaching session in each week’s reflection presented a concern for blending teaching with technology. Initially, the mentor teacher acknowledged that the use of technology contributes to beginning teachers’ role in introducing core concepts of chemistry. In this light, while beginning teachers may have difficulty in presenting new concepts, the supplementary role of technology may become a space for teacher creativity, thus, strengthening the beginning teacher’s conception of their own teacher identity.

Still, the mentor teacher acknowledged the following:

“I was wary if she was prepared enough to take on the role of the teacher in the classroom. Her use of different types of technology in the classroom showed me otherwise, she actually utilized the smart board while explaining the concepts of solids, liquids, and gas and her explanations were even clearer to students, students responded positively to her teaching.”

A love of pedagogy suggests empathy toward the learning experiences of others. Epistemic empathy in teaching as it refers to the recognition of the ways individuals make sense of educational events connotes a cognitive and affective appraisal of novice teachers' teaching conditions on the mentor's part (Jaber, 2021). In a case study conducted by Jaber (2021), it is shown that a teacher may choose to adopt teaching practices that they initially deemed dubious after an epistemic inquiry into their discipline followed by an inquiry into their relationship with students. Similarly, mentor teachers' initial reservations about novice teachers' demonstration of digital literacy transformed into the adoption of a supportive approach towards the use of unfamiliar digital activities in the classroom through teacher empathy.

The mentor teacher indicates that the mentee teacher used her beginning teacher experience to her advantage. The initial confusion of the transition from student to teacher helped the mentee teacher use her own student experience while constructing a student-centered lesson plan. Although positioned with power in her classroom through a formal qualification in teaching, she shares the teaching platform with students and thus, subverts the traditional discourse in which the teacher is the sole “knowledge transmitter”.

Mentoring was a collective endeavor in the school. School practices allowed mentee teachers to observe teachers other than the mentor teacher. She observed classes of different subjects, which appears to help her associate chemistry with other subjects in her classes. During the introduction of water resources in class, the mentee teacher refers to biologists' description of water as the “liquid of life”. The mentor teacher also highlights the constructive role of associating different subjects in class as a way of strengthening the mentee teacher's understanding of teaching as an “organic” practice:

“ While introducing proteins, she brought a digestive system model from a biology lab and explained the steps of the digestive process of proteins.”

Similar to the way the mentee teacher shows an organic approach toward chemistry education, her mentoring experience displays an organic understanding of the mentoring experience. As shown by Loremann (2011), being part of the school community suggests a care for any individual which is linked with building on collective capacity bound by the love for taking part in the education.

## 5. Discussion and Conclusion

This case study explored the ways pedagogical strategies employed by a novice teacher contribute to identity formation from the mentor's stance. Pedagogical strategies used by the mentee teacher have been situated within the conceptual framework of pedagogical love. While the study utilizes observation of the pedagogical interaction between the mentor, mentee, and the students in the classroom through the recording of a videotape, repeated observations may provide more opportunities to capture a fuller picture of the pedagogical strategies used.

Firstly, sharing love for the teaching profession with the mentor teacher propelled the mentee to engage in professional dialogue which helped her level with her students. Thus, assuming the role of the student and the teacher simultaneously in the classroom context mentee teacher questioned the duality of these roles which brought about an understanding of professional identity that arose from dialogue.

Sockett's (2008) moral agent professional model argues that teaching professionals engage in educational activities that display moral values in action. Love for pedagogy helps teaching professionals internalize these moral values such as empathy and use them for constructive practices in daily teaching occurrences. Just as the mentor teacher showed reservations about the competencies of the mentee teacher in digital literacy empathy for the novice teacher enabled the mentor teacher to encourage the mentee teacher in her experiment of a teaching practice. Spaces of ambiguity form platforms of creativity for the mentee. Encouraged by the mentor teacher, incremental progress is celebrated to ensure that guided risk-taking results in successful outcomes. The novice teacher's developing professional identity is also enhanced by the ease technology brings by simplifying addressing multiple intelligences of students. It also becomes a way of gaining recognition from gatekeepers such as the mentor teacher.

Learning how to engage in professional dialogue with an experienced colleague such as the mentor teacher guides the novice teacher towards developing a teaching intuition which leads to a student-centered approach in pedagogical strategies. Novice teacher intuition along with the experience the mentor teacher displays helps the mentee develop her repertoire of teaching practices. The pedagogical authority displayed by the mentor teacher helps the mentee to use her novice teacher's intuition in a safe platform. As she assumes responsibility for her

teaching practice, her developing professional identity also gains recognition from the mentor teacher who acts as a gatekeeper for the teaching community.

The descriptive case study also shows that teaching is “local” in that individual pedagogical strategies specific to that school community serve as an active agent in novice teachers’ professional identity development (Wenger, 1998). Just as Developing professional identity is moving beyond the closed doors; it is rather an open, organic process that is shaped and reinterpreted by the whole school community forming a sense of community that implies trust, sacrifice, and forgiveness which all emanate from mutual love for individuals and the teaching profession itself.

### **Acknowledgments**

Not applicable

### **Authors contributions**

The author was solely responsible for the conception, design, data collection, analysis, and interpretation of the study.

### **Funding**

Not applicable

### **Competing interests**

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

### **Informed consent**

Obtained.

### **Ethics approval**

The Publication Ethics Committee of the Canadian Center of Science and Education.

The journal’s policies adhere to the Core Practices established by the Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE).

### **Provenance and peer review**

Not commissioned; externally double-blind peer reviewed.

### **Data availability statement**

The data that support the findings of this study are available on request from the corresponding author. The data are not publicly available due to privacy or ethical restrictions.

### **Data sharing statement**

No additional data are available.

### **References**

- Barnes, D. (1976). *From Communication to Curriculum*. Harmondsworth: Penguin.
- Beauchamp, C., & Thomas, L. (2009). Understanding teacher identity: An overview of issues in the literature and implications for teacher education. *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 39(2), 175–189. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057640902902252>
- Berger, J. L., & Lê Van, K. (2019). Teacher professional identity as multidimensional: mapping its components and examining their associations with general pedagogical beliefs. *Educational Studies*, 45(2), 163–181. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03055698.2018.1446324>
- Brookfield, S. (2009). The concept of critical reflection: Promises and contradictions. *European Journal of Social Work*, 12(3), 229–304. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13691450902945215>
- Bullough Jr, R. V., & Pinnegar, S. (2009). The happiness of teaching (as eudaimonia): Disciplinary knowledge and the threat of performativity. *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice*, 15(2), 241–256. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13540600902875324>
- Canrinus, E. T., Helms-Lorenz, M., Beijgaard, D., Buitink, J., & Hofman, A. (2011). Profiling teachers’ sense of professional identity. *Educational Studies*, 37(5), 593–608. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03055698.2010.539857>
- Carter, M., & Francis, R. (2001). Mentoring and beginning teachers' workplace learning. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education*, 29(3), 249–262. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13598660120091856>



- Chu, Y. (2019). Mentor teacher professional identity development in a year-long teacher residency. *Mentoring & Tutoring: Partnership in Learning*, 27(3), 251–271. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13611267.2019.1630991>
- Crawford, M. (2007). Emotional coherence in primary school headship. *Educational Management Administration & Leadership*, 35(4), 521–534. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1741143207081061>
- Crutcher, P. A., & Naseem, S. (2016). Cheerleading and cynicism of effective mentoring in current empirical research. *Educational Review*, 68(1), 40–55. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00131911.2015.1058749>
- de Paor, C. (2019). Lesson observation, professional conversation and teacher induction. *Irish Educational Studies*, 38(1), 121–134. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03323315.2018.1521733>
- Douglas, T. R. M., & Nganga, C. W. (2015). Radical loving, radical leading: negotiating complex identities, positionalities, and pedagogies in social justice work. In *Living the Work: Promoting Social Justice and Equity Work in Schools around the World* (vol. 23, pp. 59–85). Emerald Group Publishing Limited. <https://doi.org/10.1108/S1479-366020140000023003>
- Ezer, H., Gilat, I., & Sagee, R. (2010). Perception of teacher education and professional identity among novice teachers. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 33(4), 391–404. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02619768.2010.504949>
- Fernández-Cano, A., Torralbo, M., Vallejo, M., & Fernández-Guerrero, I. M. (2012). A narrative review of Greek myths as interpretative metaphors in educational research and evaluation. *Educational Research Review*, 7(3), 238–248. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.edurev.2012.07.001>
- Gilles, C., Wang, Y., Fish, J., & Stegall, J. (2018). “I learned by watching my mentor.” Nurturing teacher leadership with an induction program. *Mentoring & Tutoring: Partnership in Learning*, 26(4), 455–475. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13611267.2018.1530174>
- Han, I. (2017). Conceptualisation of English teachers’ professional identity and comprehension of its dynamics. *Teachers and Teaching*, 23(5), 549–569. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13540602.2016.1206525>
- Harjunen, E. (2009). How do teachers view their own pedagogical authority? *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice*, 15(1), 109–129. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13540600802661345>
- Huisman, S., Singer, N. R., & Catapano, S. (2010). Resiliency to success: Supporting novice urban teachers. *Teacher Development*, 14(4), 483–499. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13664530.2010.533490>
- Jaber, L. Z. (2021). “He got a glimpse of the joys of understanding” – The role of epistemic empathy in teacher learning. *Journal of the Learning Sciences*, 30(3), 433–465. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10508406.2021.1936534>
- Johnson, L. L., Bryan, N., & Boutte, G. (2019). Show us the love: Revolutionary teaching in (un)critical times. *The Urban Review*, 51, 46–64. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11256-018-0488-3>
- Kenklies, K. (2019). The struggle to love: pedagogical eros and the gift of transformation. *Journal of Philosophy of Education*, 53(3), 547–559. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-9752.12376>
- Lamote, C., & Engels, N. (2010). The development of student teachers’ professional identity. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 33(1), 3–18. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02619760903457735>
- Liou, Y. H., Daly, A. J., Canrinus, E. T., Forbes, C. A., Moolenaar, N. M., Cornelissen, F., ... Hsiao, J. (2017). Mapping the social side of pre-service teachers: connecting closeness, trust, and efficacy with performance. *Teachers and Teaching*, 23(6), 635–657. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13540602.2016.1218329>
- Loemann, T. (2011). *Love as pedagogy*.
- Maatta, K., & Uusiautti, S. (2012). Pedagogical Authority and Pedagogical Love – Connected or Incompatible? *International Journal of Whole Schooling*, 8(1), 21–39.
- Määttä, K., & Uusiautti, S. (2013). Pedagogical love and good teacherhood. In *Many faces of love* (pp. 93–101). Sense Publishers, Rotterdam. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-6209-206-8\\_7](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-6209-206-8_7)
- MEB. (2016). *Aday öğretim yetiştirme programı*. Retrieved from <http://varto.meb.gov.tr/www/aday-ogretim-yetistirme-programi-17102016/icerik/928>
- OECD. (2014). *TALIS 2013 Technical Report*. Paris: OECD Publishing
- OECD. (2020). *Education Policy Outlook-Turkey*. Paris: OECD Publishing
- Payne, K. A. (2018). Democratic teachers mentoring novice teachers: Enacting democratic practices and pedagogy in teacher education. *Action in Teacher Education*, 40(2), 133–150.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/01626620.2018.1424052>

- Pillen, M., Beijaard, D., & Den Brok, P. (2013). Professional identity tensions of beginning teachers. *Teachers and Teaching*, 19(6), 660–678. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13540602.2013.827455>
- Schatz-Oppenheimer, O. (2017). Being a mentor: novice teachers' mentors' conceptions of mentoring prior to training. *Professional Development in Education*, 43(2), 274–292. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19415257.2016.1152591>
- Sharlamanov, K., & Jovanoski, A. (2016). Migration in Balkan Countries as Social Phenomenon. *Wulfenia Journal*, 23(9), 236–242.
- Sockett, H. (2008). The moral and epistemic purposes of teacher education. In *Handbook of research on teacher education* (pp. 45–65). Routledge.
- Stake, R. (2009). The case study method in social inquiry. In R. Gomm, M. Hammersley & P. Foster (Eds.), *Case study method* (pp. 18–26). SAGE Publications Ltd. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9780857024367.d5>
- Tschannen-Moran, M. (2014). The interconnectivity of trust in schools. In *Trust and school life* (pp. 57–81). Springer, Dordrecht. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-017-8014-8\\_3](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-017-8014-8_3)
- van Ginkel, G., Oolbekkink, H., Meijer, P. C., & Verloop, N. (2016). Adapting mentoring to individual differences in novice teacher learning: the mentor's viewpoint. *Teachers and Teaching*, 22(2), 198–218. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13540602.2015.1055438>
- Wenger, E. (1998). Communities of practice: Learning as a social system. *Systems Thinker*, 9(5), 2–3.
- Wenger, E., McDermott, R. A., & Snyder, W. (2002). *Cultivating communities of practice: A guide to managing knowledge*. Harvard business press.
- Ye, J., & Zhao, D. (2019). Developing different identity trajectories: Lessons from the Chinese teachers. *Teachers and Teaching*, 25(1), 34–53. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13540602.2018.1532408>
- Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case study research: Design and methods* (Vol. 5). Sage.

### Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author, with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).