Repairing the Fractures: Steps Forward in Building Bridges Across the Racial Divide

Sarah M. Jouganatos¹, Wicondra T. Stovall² & Rose M. Borunda³

¹ College of Education, California State University, Sacramento, California, USA
² Ara’s Education Consulting, Sacramento, California, USA
³ Capital Education Institute, California State University, Sacramento, California, USA

Correspondence: Sarah M. Jouganatos, College of Education, California State University, Sacramento, California, USA.

Received: July 29, 2022           Accepted: August 16, 2022           Online Published: August 17, 2022
doi:10.5539/ijps.v14n3p24         URL: https://doi.org/10.5539/ijps.v14n3p24

Abstract
Disconnections and distrust between the United States educational system and Black communities have existed for generations. Innovative approaches to dismantle this cyclical injustice are needed. For this reason, we sought to examine three tenets of Black othermothering: advocacy, relatedness, care and concern, and how they served as a bridge to engage Black students and families with educators through cultural brokering.

Othermothering is critical to the pedagogy of Black teaching and contributed to the success of African American students prior to the 1954 ruling of Brown v. Board of Education. Following desegregation, Black students began performing disproportionately lower than their White counterparts. Additionally, 40,000 Black teachers and administrators lost their jobs and, to date, have not rebounded from this travesty in education (Farinde et al., 2016). While efforts are made to attract and retain qualified candidates who reflect the demographics of the student population, attention must be directed to ensure that ALL educators, regardless of cultural/racial match, are responsive and invested in optimal education delivery which includes increasing their relational capacity. To this end, white teachers in this study explained that othermothering improved their connection to Black students and families through advocacy, relatedness, and care and concern. Black parents/guardians equally expressed their desire for this essential support.

These findings suggest the need for increased cultural representation within our schools, a greater understanding of the importance of holistic and equitable methods of inclusion for Black students and their families, and the need for Transformative school leaders to establish cultural connectedness in their school systems. This work focuses on fostering individual evolvement that collaboratively moves educators from a state of racialized submersion to a transcendent identity. Through this individual growth, schools can bridge connections with Black students and families. One strategy to innovatively strengthen this connection is through the inclusion of an othermother.

Keywords: othermothering, transformative school leadership, BIPOC students, Black parents, cultural connectedness

1. Introduction

1.1 Introduce the Problem

Too few (7%) African American teachers are employed within the K-12 system (Hussar et al., 2020), which has negatively impacted academic achievement in African American students and the connection families of color once had with their child’s school. Such connections are in dire need of being rekindled. Although the education system has specified funding and initiatives for equity, diversity, and inclusion efforts, these efforts fail to meet the unique needs of the African American community. This problem has persisted since the onset of the education system in America.

1.2 Historical Connections

Frederick Douglass, the famous orator, abolitionist, author, and United States statesman was born in the state of Maryland at a time, 1818, in which the establishment of slavery was engrained within the cultural fabric of the deep South. Born as property of enslavers, he and several generations before him endured a purposefully
engineered and culturally embedded practice that was intended to psychologically and socially fracture person, family, community and humanity. One example of purposeful fracturing was that Mr. Douglass knew his mother's name, Harriet Bailey, but did not know her in the intimate sense of a child who is nurtured and cared for by a mother. It was the practice, at the time, that children born into the institution of slavery were separated from their mothers before the child reached twelve months of age. To ensure that this systemic fracturing of the mother and child relationship had its’ intended effect, the mother was sent away to work in a location that was a considerable distance away from the child.

This relational disconnect between mother and child has been a strategy weaponized in the United States to undermine human affinity, empathy, and identity with Black, Indigenous, and People of Color (BIPOC) communities. As noted by Mr. Douglass, it was a practice directed at enslaved humanity prior to and during the early years of the United States’ existence, again leveled against Native Americans through the forced placement of children in Boarding Schools, and, more recently, migrant children were separated from their families at the Southern border. Severing the mother and child bond has far-reaching psychological and sociological implications because of the extent to which this inhumane practice against BIPOC communities continues to be not only tolerated but also codified in policy and practice. Subsequently, acts intended to fracture human bonds at any level has led to not only psychological tolerance but its’ practice has become accepted by far too many. Indifference for the trauma created by these practices has become part of this nation’s cultural fabric and its impact remains a haunting legacy yet to be resolved.

Mr. Douglass (1994), in his autobiography, reflects on the malicious practice of severing the mother-child bond when he states, “For what this separation is done, I do not know, unless it be to hinder the development of the child’s affection toward its mother, and to blunt and destroy the natural affection of the mother for the child. This is the inevitable result” (p. 16). As we, today, reflect on these inhumane practices, it is critical to understand how the ideology that justified and promoted this brutal mistreatment has woven itself into this nation’s cultural fabric. Considering the multiple ways in which such relational fracturing has undermined the capacity for people to “harden” their hearts was noted not just by those subjected to relational indifference but also by those who were expected to become emotionally disassociated.

Angelina Grimké, born into a slave-holding family provides testament to the emotionally numbing process that took place in the slave-holding communities. From early in life, Grimké not only detested what she saw but was abhorred by the mistreatment of humanity. She eventually left the South and became an abolitionist. In her personal journal, she wrote about an incident that occurred when she was living in South Carolina. She was walking to the home of someone who she was tutoring. This home happened to be located near an establishment where enslaved people were sent by their enslavers to be punished. On her way to the home she heard the screams of a woman who was being drug by two youth to her punishment. The inevitable physical torment that was to be inflicted was evident in the woman’s cries for help but Grimké was not in a position to intervene. What Grimké recorded in her journal following this incident conveys her observation of the inurement to the mistreatment,
These are no things I have heard; no, my own eyes have looked upon them and wept over them… No one can imagine my feelings walking down that street. It seemed as though I was walking on the very confines of hell. This winter being obliged to pass it to pay a visit to a friend. I suffered so much that I could not get over it for days and wondered how any real Christian could live near such a place (Lerner, 1998, p. 60).

Such is the relational fractures in our society that has diminished the capacity of some people who now serve as educators, policymakers, to be fully human. This conditioning process of relational disassociation foments a culture by which suffering of ‘others’ is ignored and the devaluing of Black children has been vertically manifested over generations. For this reason, as we move forward in present day, we look to strategies that transcend the fissures in our relationships and evolve us past the fractured practices, and more so, beliefs that have disassociated human beings from one another.

2. Othermothers as In Loco Parentis for BIPOC Students

Othermothering has been defined as taking responsibility for someone else’s child in nonformal or unstructured ways and has been utilized as a framework for engaging African American students at predominately White institutions (PWIs; Edwards, 2000). Othermothering consists of a pedagogical commitment that includes advocacy, relatedness, a financial commitment and care and concern for students which are fundamental to Black teaching (Mawhinney, 2012). This is particularly important because following Brown v. Board of Education and the desegregation of public schools, African American students have performed disproportionately lower than any other race in English and math (Ford & Moore, 2013; Rönkä et al., 2017; Vanneman et al., 2009). Even when controlled for socio-economic status, African American students still perform disproportionately lower (Obgu, 2003). While it is known that family engagement increases academic achievement in students, African American parents often report feeling unwelcomed in their children’s schools because they view the institution as an authority figure rather than as a place where their children will be cared for, nurtured, and supported in reaching their highest aspirations. This, in turn, exacerbates disengagement (Dow, 2016; Latunde, 2018; Miller et al., 2000). Other factors that inhibit parental involvement in African American families include the parents’ education level and the parents’ experience with the education system as students themselves (Smrekar & Cohen-Vogel, 2001).

Following desegregation, Black students began performing disproportionately lower than their White counterparts. Additionally, 40,000 Black teachers and administrators lost their jobs and, to date, have not been able to rebound from this travesty in education, as Black teachers only make up 7% of the teaching population yet, African American students comprise 15% of the total K-12 student population (Abiola et al., 2016; NCES, 2020). The absence of representation in schools in which Black parents see teachers and administrators who come from their own communities inhibits the level of comfort and connectedness families of color have towards their child’s school.

The discrepancy between the cultural background of teachers/administrators and students and their families is generally presented from a deficit orientation in which BIPOC communities are expected to conform to Eurocentric values, curriculum, and substandard expectations. For this reason, we pose that the question should not be if Black parents care about their students in which “engagement” is measured by antiquated means such as the amount of time spent volunteering at the monthly Parent Teacher Organization, but rather by how the playing field is being leveled. This leveling can be accomplished through collaborations with othermothers who bridge the gap between students, parents and teachers. This not only helps African American students because othermothers are mothers, at heart, and care for all students. Subsequently, given our historical record of relational disassociation, this functions as a model that can especially serve BIPOC.

Othermothers collaborate with teachers and administrators to increase connectedness with students of color. Behavioral modeling and mentorship build bridges of relationship which, in turn, attenuate the racial empathy gap. By overcoming historical precedence of conditioned racialized disassociation and distrust, BIPOC (Black, Indigenous, and People of Color) students and families feel welcomed at school which, in turn, combats the Black student achievement gap.

3. Methods

For this study a mixed-method sequential exploratory design was used. In the first phase, the researcher acquired and examined feedback from parents, teachers, and administrators by way of interviews. Followed by the distribution of a quantitative survey send to African American parents and guardians to better understand their desire to have an othermothering work at their child’s school.
3.1 Qualitative

Interview participants included four school-based personnel, including two teachers and two administrators who interacted with an othermother. Interviews lasted approximately 40 minutes and were recorded and coded for themes.

3.2 Quantitative

To determine if Black parents and guardians would desire Black othermothering at their child’s school, a Black parent survey was administered on Facebook and LinkedIn, and purposefully sampling was administered at the three schools included in this study. To determine if there was a statistical significance in whether Black parents (independent variable) influenced the desire for othermothering work at their child’s school (dependent variable), a parent survey was administered on social media along with a video explaining the research objectives and purpose. The survey was administered on social media targeting parents and guardians with a goal of capturing at least 100 responses. Sixty-five African American/Black parents responded, and 54 surveys were completed. The survey captured two elements of othermothering and participants were asked the questions to determine if there is a triangulation of data between teacher, parent, administrator interviews and African American parent/guardian desire acquired through the surveys for othermothering as a means of increasing connectedness with their child’s school.

4. Findings: Understanding the Role of an Othermother

Stovall (2022) conducted a study at Ara’s Education Consulting, LLC that included four white teachers from one elementary school and one junior high school in Sacramento, California. The study examined advocacy, relatedness and care and concern, three of the five pillars of othermothering. In reference to how othermothering served as a means of cultural brokering for Black/African American students and families, teachers unanimously agreed that othermothers created a bridge between home and school and also served as a cultural coach for teachers.

For example, one teacher expressed how she observed the phrasing of the Othermother and, from the modeling, was able to learn a different approach. In her reflection, she discussed how her own biases and ‘differences’ were getting in the way of being culturally responsive to her student. She said, “...after hearing the way that you phrased it, I was able to hear it, you know, and repeat your questions to him. Which one like, I never thought of approaching it that way and then two, because I don’t look like him. I’m very conscious. You do more than just cultivate positivity, but you also stand up to some of the latent biases that I think a lot of adults have.” The Othermother, serving as cultural coach for the teacher, models responses that engender relationship, care and understanding. In doing so, they serve as a bridge to home which, in turn, facilitates greater trust and connection.

4.1 Responding to and Attenuating Historical Distrust

Fifty-four Black parents were anonymously surveyed about the need for advocacy for parents and their children. 93 percent of African American parents somewhat or fully agreed that advocacy was needed for them (Figure 1). 88 percent of African American/Black parents somewhat or fully agreed that advocacy was needed for their students (Figure 2). When survey participants were asked to rate their comfortability with other mothers providing comfort and support to their students at school, 91 percent of parent participants somewhat or fully agreed with finding comfort in a Black othermother (Figure 3).
Voluntary immigrants (Ogbu & Simmons, 1998, p. 164) consist of people who relocated to the United States by choice and have historically welcomed the learning of English and white culture as an enhancement to their life. In essence, they have embraced assimilation to the Euro-American culture way as a means toward upward mobility. Conversely, enslaved people, involuntary non-immigrant minorities (Ogbu & Simmons, 1998, p. 165), are largely comprised by Black people and the ancestors of the Black/African American participants who were forced to the United States. The abusive historical relationship has led to many Black/African Americans to resist assimilation of whiteness in society and to the school system. Therefore, the Black/African American parent participants included in this study found comfort in knowing that another mother of their family’s culture and ethnicity were available within an institution unintended for their Black children. This speaks to an undertone of their distrust in the care for their children within our educational institutions. Given the continued disparities in educational outcomes and relational disconnect, the distrust is not only just but calls for intentional approaches to overcome this perceptual animosity.

5. Discussion of the Value of Othermothering

5.1 The Right to Love Students

As one white teacher participant explained, the traditional, white cultural structure of K-12 education prioritizes boundaries and the importance of maintaining a competitive edge to excel in society over establishing meaningful
relationships with students. Othermothering gives teachers permission to love and truly care about their students first, thus when teaching is undergirded by othermothering, academic achievement will inevitably improve. Specifically, in this study, othermothering minimized the amount of time it would take for teachers to establish a rapport with African American/Black students. In reference to the othermother assigned to the school, students have said, “You’re my school mom,” “Now she know my name, now she calling me like my momma,” and “You’re like my mom” in response to various interactions. Consequently, when the othermother validated the teacher by student-observed interactions, this affirmed the teacher’s authenticity for some of the more skeptical students who also happened to be the primary leaders of the school for not so positive behaviors. When the student leaders were persuaded, other students would follow suit resulting in a deeper teacher/student relationship and increased learning for multiple students.

5.2 The Misconception of Black Mothers and the Power of Black Othermothering

Although the teachers included in this study were experienced at a span of 5 – 30 years of teaching, and confident they would establish a relationship with their students by January, midway through the school year, othermothering expedited this process. It enabled two of the teachers to establish a relationship in as early as November of the school year and helped another teacher better understand Black culture. One teacher said, “I have always been abrasive towards Black women.” Othermothering allowed the teacher to pose questions she would have been uncomfortable expressing before approaching the Black parent. This deepened understanding of cultural nuances and allowed the teacher to understand that, “I’m not talking to a Black boy’s mom, I am talking to a concerned mom.” In this way, othermothering served as a method of advocacy for the parent and student, bridging the connection from home to school.

Due to the warm and motherly nature of othermothering at school, when in distress, students would seek out the school’s othermother, over their school counselor. One teacher participant shared that because she was an educator, she felt that her position created a disconnect with some students and parents. In reference to the othermothering work at one junior high, one teacher said, “Its powerful that when they are looking for someone to help them and identify with them, they’re looking for an adult that they know cares about them on campus, that they know will have their back that day. I mean, it’s a beautiful relationship.”

5.3 Leaders as the Agents of Change

Educational injustices run deep and wide throughout American school systems. Our educational systems were not originally created and intended to serve diverse student populations. Subsequently, social justice initiatives were enacted to address the disparities but did not always have optimal results. For example, Brown v. Board of Education desegregated schools but it also resulted in almost all African American teachers losing their jobs while simultaneously African American students were subjected to racist schooling instructional practices and a curriculum grounded in white dominant culture. Subsequently, the emphasis on standardized testing as a way of measurement of success only exacerbated the exclusion of and then inequality for BIPOC children in our schools. For this reason, expanding and serving diverse student populations, must also enhance the capacity of systems and policies, to be culturally responsive. A precursor to systemic evolvement means that the hearts of our educators must overcome inherent prejudices and lowered expectations that are projected upon our student populations and their families of origin.

Although many educators and stakeholders have focused on dismantling inequities and creating a just educational system the work is far from complete (Graham & Nevarez, 2017; Ladson-Billings, 1994; Villegas & Lucas, 2002). In fact, the work of overcoming our racialized legacy will take generations. As found in this research, collective efforts are what will move this practice forward. Specific to this work are strategic initiatives that will support African American students by increasing their connectedness to school.

Leadership is the foundation to making such cultural shifts. By establishing and recognizing the need to focus on supporting African American students, leaders take the first step toward constructing change. It is through this recognition and initial efforts that a school leader can be a “facilitator of evolvement” (Borunda, 2020, Ch. 12, p. 3) and by doing so, transforms, elevates, and re-establishes our culture from one rooted in racism to one that builds bridges of empathy, care, and higher-level thinking.

Borunda, (2020) offers the Transcendent Identity Development Model which discusses the possibility of movement from a submerged identity to a transcendent identity. A submerged identity is characterized by dichotomous thinking and actions in which everything is viewed as either “good” or “bad” without examining context or perspective. Other elements of this submerged identity are the use of race in order to enact power over others though the forces of domination, Victimization, and Traumatization.
Leaders who envision a world beyond a fixed reality (Freire, 1998) infuse their organizations with opportunities to develop a transcendent identity. Rooted in a rejection of racial group cohesion, this cultural shift elevates the discussion above our fractured reality which has been fomented by cognitive dissonance and historical distrust. Instead, transcendent leaders nurture the capacity of everyone in their organization to recognize and empathize with other’s experiences while developing their capacity to be more caring and loving of all humanity. In this aspirational organization, humanity can engage more purposefully with one another by being more congruent in thought and action (Borunda, 2020, Ch. 12, p. 3).

This evolution of moving from one space of thought to another takes time, effort and focus. Individuals will experience obstacles and setbacks that need to be addressed. However, with strategic collaboration and authenticity, leaders can empower and support efforts to move through this smog (i.e. unjust educational systems; African American students disconnect; teacher burnout and generational prejudices and disassociation) to a space of sharing transcendent thinking, caring, and actions.

This work can be effectively infused by a Transformative Leader utilizing Path-Goal Theory as a guide. According to Nevarez et al. (2013), “Transformative leaders anticipate, plan, and develop a multiplicity of institutional practices and efforts that are purposively designed to ‘transform’ the institution. This transformation is intended to make the institution more responsive to issues of equity and social justice” (p. 144). With this lens, the leader can utilize Path-Goal theory to move constituents from the submerged identity to a transcendent identity (Northouse, 2010; Borunda, 2020).

Path-goal theory guides leaders toward motivating employees so they reach a specific goal (Northouse, 2010). The ultimate goal here is to move individuals toward transcendent identities in order to create a more just educational setting. By blending the equity and collaborative lens of a Transformative leader with the focus and support offered through Path-Goal Theory, challenging the status quo and evolving into a collective group of transcendent educators becomes attainable.

Figure 4 illustrates a Leadership pathway for moving school constituents from a place of submerged identity traits to transcendent identities for constituents. Along the path, specific focus is given to challenging the inequitable access experienced by African American Students, welcomes challenging the status quo, and promotes innovative ways to increase African American families’ connectedness to the school system.
Implementing the Transformative Leaders as Facilitators of Evolvement Framework begins with a foundational recognition that change is mandatory. This recognition may come from one leader or an entire leadership team, regardless the goals stay the same - to move constituents from a submerged identity to a transcendent identity in order to increase Black student and family connectedness to school. This work is long and difficult for some but is the change needed to dismantle educational injustice. Through this work, obstacles will be present however a leadership team utilizes path-goal theory to identify pathways to successfully reach the goals as well as develops plans to mitigate recognized obstacles. Worth noting, obstacles and pathways will vary depending on the situation,
the stakeholders, and the educational system. Transformative leaders must guide and encourage continuants as they move through their “smog”.

As constituents move toward the collective goals, Transformative leaders would bring into the schools othermothers. By bringing in an othermother, the work of enhancing the educational experience of African American students can begin while constituents are moving toward a transcendent identity. Simultaneously infusing both othermothering and individual growth supports the work of implementing and sustaining evolvement, which is the focus for a Transformative leader. This leader will empower and encourage all involved while also pushing them to move in the right direction. While continuously focusing on their individual development toward a transcendent identity, constituents collectively work to increase the Black student and family connection to school culture. This shift in thinking and practice will be the support needed to dismantle educational injustices, specifically those experienced by Black students and families.

In some capacity, othermothering is required for the overall education system to function optimally. As indicated in the Black parent survey results, a majority (82%) of Black parents and guardians desire another mother at their student’s school in their absence. Othermothers provide a safety net for Black students while also serving as partners with teachers that are primarily White teachers (Hussar et al., 2020) who due to social conditioning have, at times, failed to respond to and connect with Black students and families. Therefore, we see this movement toward transcendent identity as a simultaneous goal because when othermothers and teachers unite, it results in an improved connection to African American students and families.

6. Conclusion

Transformative leaders who are authentically devoted to combating educational inequities experienced by African American students in particular, must think outside of normal practice. They have to construct a cultural orientation that shifts the status quo narrative to a culture of relational connectedness and mutual trust. Othermothering as a means for building bridges between students and teachers can strengthen school climate, culture, and build other teachers’ capacity to be a support system for BIPOC students. Such benefits to this approach expand beyond student connectedness it also helps minimize BIPOC teacher turn over by empowering all teachers with cultural responsiveness strategies and practices. These skills then encourage all teachers to share the responsibilities of supporting all student populations.

Recognizing a need to focus on a shift in thinking and actions is the beginning to transforming systems of oppression. This initial recognition leads to purposeful action that challenges the status quo through a collective and purposeful ideological evolution. Moving humanity from submerged thinking to transcendent thinking creates a revolution of equity and educational access. It is through this personal and professional growth that systems can be challenged to be more inclusive of our students’ needs. As transcendent thinkers, educators and stakeholders begin to focus on the needed changes that can support our African American student population. Just as the engineering of enslavers looked to destroy the caring and nurturing relationship between mother and child, othermothering looks to engineer a pathway to relational webs that transcend this nation’s racialized roots.

References


**Copyrights**

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).