# A Study on Malaysian Consumers' Attitude and Behavioral Intention Towards Print Advertising

Bee Eng Chew<sup>1</sup> & Azaze-Azizi Abdul Adis<sup>1</sup>

Correspondence: Azaze-Azizi Abdul Adis, Faculty of Business, Economics and Accountancy, Universiti Malaysia Sabah, Jalan UMS, 88400, Kota Kinabalu, Sabah, Malaysia.

Received: January 3, 2018 Accepted: April 30, 2018 Online Published: May 15, 2018

#### Abstract

The purpose of this study is to examine the relationship between belief factors, consumers' attitude, and consumers' behavioral intention toward print advertising. This study also explores the mediating role of attitude on the relationship between belief factors and consumers' behavioral intention. The six belief factors are product information, social role and image, hedonic/pleasure, irritation, personalization, and credibility. The study finds that product information, social role and image, hedonic/pleasure, irritation, and credibility have positive influences on consumers' attitude and behavioral intention. The results reveal that attitude has positive influence on consumers' behavioral intention. Moreover, the mediation analysis results indicate that the role of attitude mediating has been significant in product information, hedonic/pleasure, irritation, and credibility on behavioral intention. The target population for this study was those Malaysian people who have experience in searching for exposure to print advertising before. The respondents were classified according to their age, gender, race, occupation as well as their income levels. The questionnaires were distributed to the respondents through online survey and questionnaire tool, Google Form. Implication and recommendations for future studies are also discussed.

**Keywords:** attitude, behavioral intention, print advertising

## 1. Introduction

Today, we encounter advertisements whenever and wherever we go, from print advertising methods, such as newspapers and magazines, to online advertising methods, such as social media advertising and mobile advertising. Kotler (2000) defined advertising as a paid form of non-personal communication to promote the brands and companies' products and services. Norris (1984) noted that advertising involves two major functions, which are the provision of information and persuasion. Marketers' expenditure on advertising shows growth from year to year.

Interestingly, even with the rise of Internet, studies have found that print publications are still popular among adults and even most tablet users are keen to read news or advertisements in magazines rather than on tablets because consumers find it hard to change or switch their habits. A study conducted by United States Postal Service in 2015 found that consumers spent longer time on printed media compared to digital media. Besides, this study also proved that printed media can lead to consumers' desire for the products. Suggett (2016) defined print advertising as portable printed medium, such as newspapers, magazines, flyers or any advertisement that are printed on paper. A study conducted by Goldsmith and Lafferty (2002) shows that consumers tend to prefer television and magazine advertisements rather than online advertisements. Wakolbinger (2009) pointed out that print advertisements could increase website traffic and using print media to promote the websites could lead to higher advertisement-effectiveness and thus, increase consumers' brand awareness (Doyle et al., 1997). Adults bertween the ages of 18-29 and 30-39 are still using print media and about 6% of tablet users read magazines on their tablets everyday whereas 23% of them read magazines monthly (Mequoda Tablet Study, 2013). Desai and Patel (2014) also stated that single magazine and newspaper copies' selling rates are still higher in print form compared to digital form.

According to Malaysian Communications and Multimedia Commission (2009), marketers face challenges in recognizing consumers' attitude and behavioral intention toward advertising, for example, changing in consumers' preferences. Advancement in technology causes change in consumers' lifestyles and consumption patterns,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Faculty of Business, Economics and Accountancy, Universiti Malaysia Sabah, Malaysia

consequently causing the communication platforms to become more complicated (Malaysian Communications and Multimedia Commission, 2009). Consumers' beliefs and attitude toward advertising may evolve over time (Karson, McCloy, & Bonner, 2006). Thus, it is significant to conduct more studies on the consumers' beliefs and attitude which could lead to behavioral intention of consumers, in the context of Malaysia. Not to forget, it is important to know what factors could influence consumers' attitude and behavioral intention toward advertising so that marketers can strategize their advertising designs.

Moreover, few research studies address the concerns of marketers on how to persuade users to be more receptive to advertising (Zeng et al., 2009). Therefore, in this research, we study the factors influencing consumers' attitude and behavioral intention toward print advertising. We also want to know whether print advertising still has a place in the technology era. Among the factors are product information, social role and image, hedonic/pleasure, irritation, personalization and credibility.

The paper is organised as follows: First, there is a review on Theory of Reasoned Action (TRA) and Uses and Gratifications Theory (UGT). TRA was applied in this study because reasoned action is explicitly connected with behavior. Nevertheless, as it separates consumers' behavioral intention from behaviors, there are some circumstances that limit the attitude influence on behavior. As a consequence, this study explores the situation that limits the consumers' attitude on behavior. UGT was applied to understand why and how active people found certain media to fulfill their particular needs. Then, the next section discusses briefly the existing literature on consumers' attitude and behavioral intention toward print advertising. Then, variables of interest and proposed research model and the hypotheses to be tested are depicted. This is followed by a discussion of the study that was undertaken to test the hypotheses, with information provided on the participants, data collection, measures used, and testing of the model and hypotheses. The discussion of the results of the study follows, as does a discussion of the implications from a research and managerial perspective. The paper concludes with a discussion of the limitations of this study and some recommendations for future research.

#### 2 Literature Review

## 2.1 Theory of Reasoned Action (TRA)

According to TRA by Fishbein and Ajzen (1975), beliefs influence attitude which then shapes behavior. Fishbein and Ajzen (1975) emphasized that people are keen to perform a behavior based on their attitude. Good fit of TRA-based models will be dependent on action, object, context, and time correlations of attitude and intention (Fishbein and Ajzen, 1975). Thus, prediction of an intention needs the measurement of attitude connected to that intention. Generally, attitude draws upon TRA model (Davis et al., 1989) and Ajzen (1991) explained that attitude is the positive or negative evaluation of an individual toward a particular object or behavior. Social psychologists categorized attitude into affective component, behavioral component, and cognitive component. Affective component can be known as how much an individual prefers the object of his thoughts whereas cognitive component can be defined as beliefs of an individual toward the object (Chaiken, 1987). A study conducted by Chaiken (1987) shows that individual's have favorable positive affective and cognitive orientations toward print advertising.

Additionally, subjective norms about how to behave are considered as an attribute of behavioral intention. According to Fishbein and Ajzen (1975), behavioral intentions are the best indicator of behavior. Fishbein and Ajzen (1975) stated that subjective norms are the perceived social pressure to enact or not to enact the target behavior, whereas behavioral intentions are explained as the perceived likelihood of performing the target behavior. Fishbein and Ajzen (2005) believed that change in behavior could be influenced by the successful modification of attributes or antecedents.

## 2.2 Uses and Gratifications Theory (UGT)

UGT is one of the most influential theories used to study mass media. According to UGT theory by Katz et al. (1974), people will expose themselves to the medium or channels which are able to fulfill their needs and demands that motivate them to seek gratification of their particular needs in that medium or channels proactively. Katz et al. (1973; 1975) had developed general assumptions of Uses and Gratifications Theory. First, mass media used is goal directed since the audience is active. Audience member also influences the approach in connecting need gratification with media selection. Next, the mass media competes with other sources to fulfill the satisfaction needs of consumers. Lastly yet importantly, the gratifications sought from the media encompass entertainment and information. These attributes will change, based on the social roles and image of audience members.

UGT research has found a combination of utilitarian and non-utilitarian motivations of the advertisements in daily life settings. Intrinsic motivations could be related to internal gratifications, which are emotions, enjoyment and

socialization with other consumers (Babin et al., 1994) when they use the media. Davis et al. (1992) depicted entertainment as the degree to which an activity is seen as enjoyable and fun besides having intrinsic rewards. Thus, entertainment plays a significant role in indicating the behavioral intention towards the advertising (Davis et al., 1992). In some studies, hedonic seems to be the most consistently used gratification on print advertisements applied to teenagers (Castells et al., 2006).

According to Ducoffe (1996), cognitive needs are related with informativeness and credibility constructs in the advertisement value model. Affective needs are related with entertainment and irritation constructs. UGT enables the examination of the attributes of the medium from the consumers' point of view (McQuail, 1994) and then identifies what needs and demands of the consumers could be fulfilled (Anderson & Meyer, 1975).

## 2.3 Consumers' Attitude and Behavioral Intention Towards Print Advertising

According to Pollay and Mittal (1993), beliefs are descriptive statements about traits of the objects (e.g. advertising is entertaining) or outcomes (e.g. advertising reduces prices), while attitude can be defined as objects' summary evaluations (e.g. overall, advertising is a good/bad thing). Kotler and Keller (2008) defined attitude as favorable or unfavorable feelings and action tendencies of a person toward some objects. As a consequence, with the presence of the beliefs, our attitude toward objects would be formed (Wolin et al., 2002).

In order to measure the effectiveness of advertising, consumers' beliefs and attitude toward advertising have to be taken into considerations (Mehta, 2000). A study conducted by Wolin et al. (2002) indicated that some belief factors are positively related to the attitude toward advertising. Among the belief factors are product information, social role and image, and hedonic/pleasure. On the other hand, some belief factors like irritation are negatively related to attitude toward advertising. The results also showed that attitude toward advertising could affect the reported behavior toward advertising. Another study analyzed that personalization and credibility, which are the attributes of advertising, will influence consumers' attitude toward advertising (Xu et al., 2008). Besides, a study by Wang and Sun (2010) showed that some belief factors could influence the attitude toward advertising, which can consequently have an impact on consumers' behavioral responses, such as paying attention to ads and purchasing.

In an early comparative study conducted by Sundar et al. (1998), print advertisements are more likely to be noticed compared to the online ones. Shij and Piron (2002) also found that print advertising is more favorable due to the advertisers lack of confidence in online advertising. Nevertheless, Nysveen and Breivik (2005) concluded that there is no difference between print advertising and online advertising because consumers have more control with regard to processing print and online advertisements. Based on data from Wiesel et al. (2011), online advertising generates 17 times more profit than print advertising. According to Waal et al. (2005), internet is either a substitute or complement to traditional media. Thus, in this study, we will examine the consumers' attitude and behavioral intention toward print advertising.

In order to predict the attitude and behavioral intention toward print advertising, we developed a model based on the Theory of Reasoned Action (TRA) by Fishbein and Ajzen (1975) and Uses and Gratifications Theory (UGT) by Katz et al. (1974).

## 3. Conceptual Model and Hypotheses

#### 3.1 Product Information

Consumers always wish to have quick access to the information they want (Ling, Piew, 2010). Mehta (2000) stated that product information in the advertisements could determine the advertisements' effectiveness in gaining consumers' positive attitude toward advertisements. Positive attitude toward advertisement could be formed by product information (Yaakop, Hemsley, & Gilbert, 2011). Okazaki (2005) mentioned that informative aspect in advertisements affects consumers' attitude toward advertisements. Studies conducted by Haghirian and Madlberger (2005) proved that there is a significant relationship between product information and consumers' attitude toward advertisements (Lei & Toncar, 2009). According to Ducoffe (1996), consumers will have favorable perception and attitude toward print advertising if they perceive the advertising as an important source of information.

Research conducted by Schlosser et al. (1999) concluded that informative aspect in the advertisements could influence consumers' attitude toward advertising and lastly lead to their purchase behavioral intention. Besides, Scharl, Dickinger, and Murphy (2005) also argued that advertising-related information about products' features, prices, and offers that are relevant to the consumers will form positive attitude of the consumers toward advertisements. Information that is up-to-date also will lead to favorable attitude toward advertising among the consumers (Javid, Namin, & Noorai, 2012). Ducoffe (1996) emphasized that favorable consumers' attitude on

advertisements are relevant with product information's accessibility. Finally yet importantly, valuable information could lead to positive consumers' attitude that transfers incentives (Varshney, 2003). The following hypothesis can be proposed:

H1: The product information belief factor has positive influence on attitude toward print advertising.

# 3.2 Social Role and Image

Social role and image will influence consumers to concentrate and focus more on advertisements (Wang & Wallendorf, 2006). As a consequence, they will have more favorable attitude toward advertising (Osmonbekov, Gregory, Brown, & Xie, 2009). Recently, Ting and de Run (2015) proved that there is positive relationship between social role and image and attitude toward advertising. According to Pollay and Mittal (1993), advertising can lead to a materialistic society. Osmonbekov et al. (2009) supported the statement by Pollay and Mittal (1993) and explained that if consumers over exposed to advertisements, they will have materialistic attitude toward consumption. Advertisements that promote social role and image will lead to consumers' desires to possess material goods for show-off purpose (Abd Aziz & Ariffin, 2010).

People who care about how other people look at them or are impressed by them will be keen to have favorable attitude toward advertising (Schlenker & Leary, 1982). They wish to learn the latest fashions and trends so that they can portray a good image to others (Fitzmaurice & Comegys, 2006). Chatterjee and Hunt (1996) also stated that people who are concerned about social image will learn fashions from the advertisements continuously because they think that other people will evaluate them based on their appearances and they wish they could impress others. Some people purchase branded goods to show their social status (Mullins, 1999). Thus, they will have positive attitude toward advertising that promotes social role and image. The following hypothesis can be formulated:

H2: The social role and image belief factor has positive influence on attitude toward print advertising.

#### 3.3 Hedonic/Pleasure

When consumers are exposed to advertisements, affective emotions will be formed and then affect the consumers' attitude toward advertisements (D'Souza & Taghian, 2005). Emotions and feelings conveyed by advertisements will influence consumers' attitude on advertisements and their judgments on the organizations' products and services (Edell & Burke, 1987). Advertisements should contain fun and entertaining elements to attract consumers (Abd Aziz et al., 2008) and it would lead to consumers' favorable attitude toward advertisements (Shavitt, Lowrey, & Haefner, 1998). Besides, contents of the advertisements that contain hedonic/pleasure elements are able to attract more consumers and are perceived favorable by the consumers (Abdul Azeem & Zia ul Haq, 2012). Pleasure element is also a motivation to the consumers (O'Shaughnessy & Jackson O' Shaughnessy, 2002) as hedonic or pleasure element will lead to a positive mood of the consumers (Hoffman & Novak, 1996). Griffin (2006) also surmised that the consumers will feel excited and surprised if they are exposed to something new or which they have never seen before. This can lead to their positive beliefs toward advertising. Harvey (2006) also agreed that consumers will concentrate more on the advertisements that they have never seen before. To form positive emotions toward advertisements, the marketers can add funny elements inside the advertisements as well (Sternthal & Craig; 1983). This situation could increase the response rate of the advertisements (Tsang and Tse, 2005). The hypothesis is shown below:

H3: The hedonic/pleasure belief factor has positive influence on attitude toward print advertising.

#### 3.4 Irritation

Irritation in advertising refers to being annoyed with the advertisements' messages. When consumers are exposed to advertisements, they might feel irritated and ignore the advertisements (Altuna & Konuk, 2009). Ducoffe (1996) also stated that irritation in advertising is related to undesirable and aggravated advertising. Irritation has been a significant problem in advertising. Due to irritation, consumers might choose not to be exposed to advertisements and have negative attitude toward advertising (Stewart & Pavlou, 2002).

As consumers have control over some advertisements, they can decide what time and where they want to be exposed to the advertisements and what advertisements' contents they wish to be exposed to. As a consequence, if the consumers feel irritated with the advertisements' contents that they dislike, they can just ignore the advertisements (Carroll, Barnes, Scornavacca, & Fletcher, 2007). Ducoffe (1996) also explained that with advertisements that apply annoy-and-offend techniques, consumers will have negative attitude toward advertisements. James and Kover (1992) also pointed out that there is negative relationship between irritation and attitude toward advertisements. Rettie (2001) and Tavor (2011) argued that print advertising is more annoying than online advertising but online advertising could influence the consumers' attitude toward advertisements negatively.

Thus, irritation is believed to influence the consumers' attitude toward advertising (Bauer and Greyser, 1968). The following hypothesis can be formulated:

H4: The irritation belief factor has negative influence on attitude toward print advertising.

#### 3.5 Personalization

According to Barkhus and Dey (2003), personalization means customization of the advertisements' contents and messages to fulfill consumers' needs and wants. Basically, personalization could prevent or solve the issue of consumers' feeling of irritation or ignore the advertisements as they think that those advertisements are not related to them (Robins, 2003). Thus, personalization might help marketers to gather a certain group of target consumers with certain needs and wants and consequently, show them the advertisements that match the consumers' demands to satisfy them. This could lead to their favorable attitude toward advertising (Yan et al., 2004). Marketers could build strong relationships with consumers through personalization. In order to understand consumers well, marketers have to collect the consumers' personal information such as demographics, preferences, area and so on (Balasubramanian et al., 2002). Then, they can display advertisements with personalized messages to that particular group of target consumers. Watson et al. (2000) also found that if advertisements meet consumers' preferred time and location, they tend to have positive attitude toward advertisements. The hypothesis is as below:

H5: The personalization belief factor has positive influence on attitude toward print advertising.

## 3.6 Credibility

According to Haller (1974), advertisements can be perceived as useful and believable. Abdul Azeem and Zia ul Haq (2012) found that credibility can lead to positive consumers' attitude toward advertising. Credibility of advertisements is interconnected with the organizations' trustworthiness and the person who delivers the advertising messages. (Goldsmith et al., 2000). If consumers have favorable perception toward the organizations, they will be likely to have positive attitude toward advertising because they will perceive the organizations' products and services positively (Sallam, 2011). Petty and Cacioppo (1986) stated that trustworthiness element in the advertisements' contents can increase the consumers' response rate toward advertising. Tsang, Ho, and Liang (2004) also agreed that credibility will affect consumers' attitude toward advertising.

Images displayed in advertisements can be more memorable than words (Chiders & Houston, 1984). Consumers also tend to believe what the professionals and experts say (Chiu, 2008). Believability is an important element to credibility (Adler & Rodman, 2000). The consumers are likely to have positive attitude toward advertising if the advertisements are able to change consumers' existing beliefs to new beliefs on the products and services (Maloney, 1994). The hypothesis proposed is shown below:

H6: The credibility belief factor has positive influence on attitude toward print advertising.

# 3.7 Attitude and behavioral intention toward print advertising

According to Leigh and Gabel (1992), consumers tend to have positive behavioral intention toward advertising when they perceive advertisements are reliable and entertaining. Consumers' attitude toward advertisements is the best indicator to determine consumers' behavioral intention (Wang et al., 2009). Some past studies also found that there is positive relationship between attitude toward advertising and behavioral intention among the consumers (Tsang et al., 2004). Past research also proved that consumers who have positive attitude toward advertisements tend to be involved more in the advertisements and spend more time in responding to the information related in the advertisements (Mehta, 2000). Those consumers who are convinced by the advertisements will have higher intention to purchase the products and services (Mehta, 2000)

Interestingly, Pollay and Mittal (1993) depicted that consumers' attitude toward advertising will determine their preferences and liking toward the products and services. The consumers might shift their attitude from unfavorable to a favorable one when they feel pleasure from the advertisements (Shavitt et al., 1998). Consumers' attitude toward advertising will form their desires on the advertised products and services (Bush, Smith, & Martin, 1999). They will start to look for more information regarding the products and services, which finally leads to their behavioral intention. Positive attitude towards advertising will lead to purchase intention (Brown & Satyam, 1992). Goldsmith and Lafferty (2002) also found that positive consumers' attitude will lead to brand recall which will then influence their behavioral intention (Jacoby, Szybillo, & Busato-Schach, 1977). Advertisements are able to provide useful and important information to consumers and finally influence their attitude (Kola & Akinyele, 2010). In a nutshell, attitude change in consumers, especially from unfavorable attitude to favorable attitude, will lead consumers to behavioral intention, such as intention to purchase the products and services. Thus, the hypothesis is:

H7: Consumers' attitude toward print advertising is positively related to their reported behavioral intention toward print advertising.

#### 4. Method

#### 4.1 Participants

The target population for this study was those Malaysians who have experience in searching for or exposure to print advertising before. The respondents were classified according to their ages, genders, races, occupations, as well as their income levels. In this study, questionnaires were distributed to the respondents through online survey and questionnaire tool, Google Form. The questionnaires were distributed to the respondents during the second week of June and compiled in the second week of July 2017. The respondents were from different states in Malaysia, Kuala Lumpur, Penang, Sabah, Sarawak, Perak, etc. A total of 250 questionnaires were distributed. However, only 215 questionnaires were returned. Out of these 215 responses, 15 questionnaires were not usable due to failure of the respondents to provide answers for some of the questions.

Approximately 70.5% (141) of the respondents were in the age range of 18-29, 27% or (54) in the age range of 30-39 and another 1.5% (3) in the age range of 40-49. This is followed by 1% (2) in the age range of 50-59. 32.5% (65 respondents) or 32.5% had incomes of less than RM900 whereas 25.5% (51 respondents) had incomes RM 900-RM 1999. This was followed by 27% (54 respondents) with incomes RM 2000-RM 3999 and 7.5% or 15 respondents with incomes RM 4000-RM 5999. 7.5% or 15 respondents have incomes RM5999 and above. Education-wise, 2 respondents or 1% possess Malaysia Certificate of Education and 4 respondents or 2% possess Malaysian Higher School Certificate. 4% (8 respondents) possess a Diploma and 87% or 174 respondents possess a Degree. Lastly, there were 6% or 12 respondents who were Master Degree holders. Among the 200 respondents, 24.5% or 49 respondents were Muslim, 22% or 44 respondents were Christian, 30% or 60 respondents were Buddhist, 22.5% or 45 respondents were Hindu, and 1% or 2 respondents were Taoist. Ethnicity wise, 14.5% or 29 respondents were Bumiputera Sabah, 3.5% (7 respondents) were Bumiputera Sarawak, 24.5% (49 respondents) were Malay, 35% (70 respondents) were Chinese, and 22.5% (45 respondents) were Indian.

#### 4.2 Measures

The questionnaire design started with a brief introduction of the research and purpose for conducting this research. The questionnaires were divided into two parts, part A and part B. Part A was the demographic profiles of the respondents, such as gender, age, occupation, race, religion, education level, income level, and etc. by using Likert scale questions. Part B encompassed the questions with five points Likert scale, questioning the respondents about the impact of product information, social role and image, hedonic/pleasure, irritation, personalization, and credibility on consumers' attitude and behavioral intention toward print advertising. The respondents were required to choose one answer from (1) strongly disagree; (2) disagree; (3) neither agree nor disagree (4) agree; (5) strongly agree.

The measurement model for each of the studied constructs was examined based on the results of the reliability, convergent validity and discriminant validity, prior to the testing of the hypothesized model of the current study. According to Hair, Anderson, Tatham and Black (1998), the composite reliability (CR) estimates the extent to which a set of latent construct indicators share in their measurement of a construct, whilst the average variance extracted (AVE) is the amount of common variance among latent construct indicators. The composite reliability test determines the internal consistency of the measurement model (Karjaluoto et al., 2008). As shown in Table 4.2 (i) and (ii), all loadings were higher than 0.5 as suggested by Hair, Black, Babin and Anderson (2010), the AVE of all studied constructs exceeded 0.5 (Bagozzi et al., 1981) and the composite reliability (CR) were all higher than 0.7 as recommended by Hair et al. (2010).

Based on Table 1, the results show that the loadings for all the measurement items of the constructs ranged between 0.720 and 0.936, which exceeded the cut-off value of 0.50. Items I3 and I4 were deleted because their factor loadings were less than the cut-off value of 0.50. Furthermore, the average variance extracted (AVE) for each of the constructs was in the range of 0.640 and 0.854, which exceeded the recommended value of 0.50 (Hair et al., 2010; Fornell & Larcker, 1981). The composite reliability for all the items ranged between 0.876 and 0.939, which exceeded the recommended value of 0.70 (Hair et al., 2010). In evaluating the discriminant validity of the model, tests were performed as to whether the square root of AVE for each construct is greater than the correlation with each other construct, which is suggested by Fornell and Larcker (1981).

Table 1. Measurement model for print advertising

Construct	Item	Loading	Cronbach's Alpha	CR	AVE
Attitude	Att1	0.88	0.913	0.939	0.794
	Att2	0.917			
	Att3	0.889			
	Att4	0.877			
Behavioral Intention	BI1	0.838	0.816	0.876	0.64
	BI2	0.72			
	BI3	0.826			
	BI4	0.811			
Credibility	C1	0.807	0.852	0.898	0.687
	C2	0.831			
	C3	0.843			
	C4	0.835			
Hedonic/Pleasure	H1	0.849	0.883	0.918	0.738
	H2	0.855			
	Н3	0.888			
	H4	0.843			
Irritation	I1	0.912	0.83	0.921	0.854
	12	0.936			
Personalization	P1	0.835	0.899	0.929	0.767
	P2	0.866			
	P3	0.903			
	P4	0.897			
Product Information	PI1	0.792	0.86	0.905	0.705
	PI2	0.808			
	PI3	0.905			
	PI4	0.848			
Social Role and Image	SI1	0.859	0.885	0.919	0.741
	SI2	0.868			
	SI3	0.849			
	SI4	0.866			

Note. AVE: Average Variance Extracted; CR: Composite Reliability: Items I3, I4 were deleted.

## 5. Results

## 5.1 Reliability and Validity

Table 2 represents the square root of average variance extracted and the correlations between the constructs for print advertising. The square root of AVE was greater than the correlation with any other constructs. With regard to cross loadings, Hair, Ringle and and Sarstedt (2013) suggested that the loadings should be higher than the cross loadings by at least 0.1 to indicate adequate discriminant validity. As shown in Table 3 the loadings of all constructs fulfill this criterion. Overall, the measurement model in this study has been satisfactory with the evidence of adequate reliability, convergent validity and discriminant validity.

# 5.2 Test of Structural Relationships

To estimate the structural model and testing the hypothesized relationships, a sub-sample of 500 was run in the bootstrap procedure in order to generate the path coefficients and t-value results. The results for the structural model relationships and the significance of hypotheses testing were shown in Table 3. In Table 3, the results showed that the R2 value of 0.617 suggesting that 61.7% of the variances in attitude can be explained by product information, social role and image, hedonic/pleasure, irritation, and credibility. To be exact, product information ( $\beta = 0.381$ , t-value = 3.925, p<0.01), social role and image ( $\beta = -0.133$ , t-value = 1.838, p<0.05), hedonic/pleasure ( $\beta = 0.347$ , t-value = 4.026, p<0.01), irritation ( $\beta = -0.126$ , t-value = 2.406, p<0.01), and credibility ( $\beta = 0.157$ , t-value = 2.482, p<0.01) have positive influences on attitude. Thus H1, H2, H3, H4, H6 were supported whereas H5 was not supported. In addition, the R2 value 0.375 suggests that 37.5% of the variances in behavioral intention can be explained by attitude. The results revealed that attitude ( $\beta = 0.613$ , t-value = 12.27 p<0.01) has a positive effect on behavioral intention toward print advertising. Thus H7 was supported.

Table 2. Discriminant validity for print advertising

Construct	Attitude	Behavioral Intention	Credibility	Hedonic	Irritation	Personalization	Product Information	Social Role and Image
Attitude	0.891							
Behavioral Intention	0.613	0.8						
Credibility	0.591	0.545	0.829					
Hedonic/Pleasure	0.71	0.612	0.604	0.859				
Irritation	-0.215	-0.08	-0.116	-0.162	0.924			
Personalization	0.588	0.636	0.669	0.669	-0.088	0.876		
Product Information	0.668	0.525	0.551	0.677	-0.003	0.55	0.84	
Social Role and	0.543	0.596	0.585	0.664	0.024	0.638	0.741	0.861
Image								

Table 3. Structural model and hypothesis testing for print advertising

Hypothesis	Relationship	Std.Beta	Std.Error	T value	Decision	R2	f2	VIF
H1(a)	Product Information -> Attitude	0.381	0.097	3.925**	Supported	Supported 0.617		2.613
	Social Role and Image	-0.133	0.072	1.838*	Supported		0.016	2.821
H2(a)	-> Attitude							
H3(a)	Hedonic/Pleasure ->	0.347	0.086	4.026**	Supported		0.12	2.633
	Attitude							
H4(a)	Irritation -> Attitude	-0.126	0.053	2.406**	Supported		0.039	1.074
H5(a)	Personalization ->	0.115	0.07	1.627	Not supported		0.014	2.416
	Attitude							
H6(a)	Credibility -> Attitude	0.157	0.063	2.482**	Supported		0.031	2.075
H7(a)	Attitude -> Behavioral	0.613	0.05	12.27**	Supported	0.375	0.601	1
	Intention							

Note. t-values > 1.645\*(p<0.05); t-values > 2.33\*\*(p<0.01).

### 5.3 Mediated Analysis

Preacher and Hayes (2004, 2008) method of bootstrapping the indirect effect was used to test the mediation analysis. In Table 4, the results showed that the bootstrapping analysis revealed that the indirect effect  $\beta = 0.234$ was significant with a t-value of 3.98 for the relationship between product information and behavioral intention toward print advertising mediated by attitude. The indirect effect 0.234, 95% Boot CI: [LL = 0.125, UL = 0.35] did not include a 0 in between indicating that there was a mediation. Thus, the relationship between product information and behavioral intention toward print advertising mediated by attitude was supported. However, for the relationship between social role and image and behavioral intention toward print advertising mediated by attitude, the indirect effect  $\beta = -0.081$  was not significant with t-value of 1.804. The indirect effect of -0.081, 95% Boot CI: [LL = -0.18, UL = 0] comprised a 0 in between indicating there was no mediation. Hence, attitude did not affect the relationship between social role and image and behavioral intention toward print advertising. The bootstrapping analysis revealed that the indirect effect  $\beta = 0.213$  was significant with a t-value of 3.693 at p<0.01 for the relationship between hedonic/pleasure and behavioral intention toward print advertising mediated by attitude. As suggested by Preacher and Hayes (2008) the indirect effect 0.213, 95% Boot CI: [LL = 0.103, UL = 0.33] did not straddle a 0 in between indicating there was mediation. Consequently, we can conclude that the mediation effect was statistically significant. The bootstrapping analysis for the relationship between irritation and behavioral intention toward print advertising mediated by attitude shows that the indirect effect  $\beta = -0.077$  was significant with a t-value of 2.376. The indirect effect -0.077, 95% Boot CI: [LL =-0.14, UL =-0.02] did not straddle a 0 in between indicating that there was mediation effect on irritation and behavioral intention toward print advertising. In contrast, the bootstrapping analysis for the relationship between personalization and behavioral intention shows that the indirect effect  $\beta = 0.07$  was not significant with a t-value of 1.578. The indirect effect 0.07, 95% Boot CI: [LL =-0.02, UL =0.16] included a 0 in between indicating that there was no mediation. Finally, the bootstrapping analysis for the relationship between credibility and behavioral intention mediated by attitude shows that the indirect effect  $\beta = 0.096$  was significant with a t-value of 2.325. The indirect effect 0.096, 95% Boot CI: [LL =0.011, UL =0.18] did not comprise a 0 in between indicating that there was a mediation. Thus, the relationship between credibility and behavioral intention was mediated by attitude.

Table 4. Mediation analysis for print advertising

Relationship	Indirect	Std. Error	T value	LL	UL	Results
	Effect					
Product Information -> Attitude -> Behavioral	0.234	0.059	3.98**	0.125	0.35	Significant
Intention						
Social Role and Image -> Attitude ->	-0.081	0.045	1.804	-0.18	0	Not significant
Behavioral Intention						
Hedonic/Pleasure -> Attitude-> Behavioral	0.213	0.058	3.693**	0.103	0.33	Significant
Intention						
Irritation -> Attitude -> Behavioral Intention	-0.077	0.033	2.376*	-0.14	-0.02	Significant
Personalization -> Attitude-> Behavioral	0.07	0.045	1.578	-0.02	0.16	Not significant
Intention						
Credibility -> Attitude -> Behavioral Intention	0.096	0.041	2.325*	0.011	0.18	Significant

*Note.* t-values > 1.96\*(p<0.05); t-values > 2.58\*\*(p<0.01).

#### 6. Discussion

Further to the analysis made on the relationship between belief factors and consumers' attitude toward print advertising in the previous chapter, five out of six dimensions i.e. product information, social role and image, hedonic/pleasure, irritation, and credibility have positive influences on consumers' attitude toward print advertising whereas the dimension of personalization has no positive influence on consumers' attitude toward print advertising.

Product information. The findings in this study suggest that hypothesis for H1 was accepted, which indicates product information belief factor has positive influence on attitude toward print advertising. It also indicates that consumers do perceive-product information as an important determinant which then will influence consumers' attitude toward print advertising. In other words, consumers tend to have positive attitude toward print advertising if they perceive the advertisements have product information that they want, such as price and features. The findings of this study are consistent with previous studies where product information will influence consumers' attitude toward advertising (Ducoffe, 1996; Schlosser et al, 1999). Furthermore, the study conducted by Bauer and Greyser (1968) and Dutta-Bergman (2006) also indicates that consumers like the advertisements and support the advertisements because of the informative aspect of the advertisements.

Social role and image Hypothesis H2 was accepted. It means there is positive relationship between the social role and image belief factor and consumers' attitude toward print advertising. According to Sangkhawasi and John (2007), advertising will lead to a materialistic society. Consumers will try to close the discrepancy gap between their ideal image and actual self-image after they have been exposed to the advertisements (Troisi et al., 2007). Besides, consumers tend to be attracted by advertisements that display social status and consequently, lead them to purchase behavioral intention (Podoshen & Andrzejewski, 2012). Thus, social role and image belief factor is important in influencing consumers' attitude toward print advertising.

Hedonic/Pleasure The findings in this study suggest that hypothesis H3 was accepted, which indicates there is significant relationship between hedonic/pleasure and consumers' attitude toward print advertising. In other words, hedonic/pleasure has positive influence on consumers' attitude toward print advertising. The findings of this study are consistent with previous studies indicating the positive relationship between hedonic/pleasure and consumers' attitude (Saadeghvaziri & Seyedjavadain, 2011). Likewise, Katterbach (2002) mentioned that contents of the advertisements that are concise and funny can grab consumers' attention easily. Due to the proliferation of advertising nowadays, advertisements that contain entertainment dimension could grab consumers' attention in an effective way and satisfy their enjoyment and emotional needs. Therefore, in order to form positive emotions toward advertisements, marketers can add entertainment elements inside the advertisements to increase the response rate of the advertisements. Based on the discussion above, hedonic/pleasure is very important to consumers and provide values to consumers. Thus, the findings of this study suggest that hedonic/pleasure belief factor is essential in forming the consumers' attitude toward print advertising. In other words, the higher the consumers' perception of the hedonic factor in the advertisements, the more likely it is that customers will have a favorable attitude toward print advertising.

*Irritation* Hypothesis H4 was accepted, which explains irritation belief factor has negative influence on consumers' attitude toward print advertising. The results of the study on irritation belief factor are consistent with the previous studies. James and Kover (1992) depicted that irritation has negative relationship on consumers' attitude toward advertisements. Some consumers feel agitated when they are exposed to advertisements, especially during the time

they are reading news on printed media, which could lead to the negative attitude of consumers toward the advertisements (Tavor, 2011). According to Saadeghvaziri et al. (2013), irritation belief factor in the advertisements might reduce the value of the advertisements, and consequently have a bad influence on the consumers' attitude toward advertisements. Ducoffe (1996) also depicted that advertisements that apply annoy-and-offend techniques on advertisements will cause negative attitude toward advertisements among the consumers. Based on the discussion above, irritation belief factor has to be taken into consideration by the marketers because they have to reduce the irritation element in the advertisements to prevent the consumers from feeling irritated or ignoring the advertisements. Thus, the findings of this study suggest that irritation belief factor has negative influence on attitude toward print advertising. In other words, the higher the irritation belief factor in the print advertisements, the more likely it is that the customers will have negative attitude toward print advertising.

Personalization The findings in this study suggest that hypothesis H5 was rejected. It means there is no positive relationship between the personalization and consumers' attitude toward print advertising. This contradicts the findings of previous studies. Previous studies found that personalization will influence consumers to concentrate and focus more on print advertisements and consequently, they will have more favorable attitude toward advertising (Wang & Wallendorf, 2006). In this study, personalization is unable to influence consumers' attitude toward print advertising. The possible reason could be that consumers feel that they cannot obtain sufficient information from the advertisements with personalized messages. Some advertisements' messages just targeted a certain group of consumers. Thus, the rest of them have to spend more time to search for more information if they are keen to know more. Thus, personalization has no influence on consumers' attitude toward print advertising. Besides, the consumers might think that other determinants are more important in affecting their attitude toward print advertising.

Credibility The findings in this study suggest that hypothesis H6 was accepted, which indicates there is significant relationship between credibility and consumers' attitude toward print advertising. In other words, credibility has positive influence on consumers' attitude toward print advertising. The findings of this study are consistent with previous studies indicating the positive relationship between credibility and consumers' attitude (Abdul Azeem & Zia ul Haq, 2012). If consumers have favorable perception toward the organizations, they will be likely to have a positive attitude toward advertising because they will perceive the organizations' products and services positively (Sallam, 2011). Based on the discussion above, credibility is a very significant determinant to consumers and provides values for them. Thus, the findings of this study suggest that credibility belief factor is essential in forming the consumers' attitude toward print advertising. In other words, the higher the consumers' perception of the credibility factor in the advertisements, the more likely it is that they will have a favorable attitude towards print advertising.

# 6.1 Research Implications

This research provides empirical evidence supporting the relationships between the belief factors i.e. product information, social role and image, hedonic/pleasure, irritation, personalization, and credibility and Malaysian consumers' behavioral intention toward print advertising. The findings of this research should benefit both academicians and practitioners in understanding the role of consumers' attitude in facilitating the belief factors and consumers' behavioral intention toward print advertising. Besides, this research could help the academicians and practitioners to understand the changes in consumers' attitude and preferences and give suggestions to the marketers on the advertisements that could grab Malaysian consumers' attention. Interestingly, this study also proved that Theory of Reasoned Action (TRA) could shape consumers' attitude into behavioral intention towards print advertising. Lastly, this research also has made a significant contribution to the body of knowledge by filling the gaps in consumers' behavioral intention literature. The current study empirically verified that product information, social role and image, hedonic/pleasure, irritation, and credibility play an essential role in shaping and creating customers' attitude and behavioral intention on print advertising. In contrast, this study proved that personalization does not have influence on consumers' attitude and behavioral intention on print advertising. This contradicts the findings of previous studies.

#### 6.2 Managerial Implications

The findings of this study provide several managerial implications for marketers, board of directors, and managers of companies. This study provides strong evidence that could help managers to gain a better understanding of consumers' attitude and behavioral intention. Precisely, it is the identification of the significant determinants that reveal consumers' attitude and behavioral intention toward print advertising. Moreover, the identification of the significant determinants that reveal consumers' behavioral intention toward print advertising allows marketing

managers or marketers to focus on better marketing strategies as well as to formulate better business strategies which are able to achieve the companies' goals.

This study has identified several main areas that need to be focused on more intensely in order to build consumers' behavioral intention. Specifically, these areas are product information, social role and image, hedonic/pleasure, irritation, personalization, and credibility as applied in the past studies conducted by Saadeghvaziri, Dehdashti, Reza, and Askarabad (2013) and David (2006).

Product information The finding of this study suggested that in order to form consumers' attitude toward print advertising, the marketers should focus on providing consumers with information that they perceive as important. Informative aspect in the print advertisements could influence consumers' attitude toward advertising and finally lead to their purchase behavioral intention. Besides, marketers should provide advertising-related information such as products' features, prices, and offers that are relevant to the consumers in order to form positive attitude of the consumers toward advertisements. Information that is up-to-date is also important for marketers to form among the consumers a positive attitude toward advertising.

Social role and image The findings of this study show that social role and image have a significant influence on consumers' attitude toward print advertising. Social role and image will influence consumers to concentrate and focus more on print advertisements. Marketers should focus on print advertisements' elements which could lead to consumers' desires to possess material goods for show-off purposes. Not to forget marketers should also display latest fashions and trends on print advertisements so people who seek social status will have a positive attitude towards print advertisements.

Hedonic/Pleasure It is also suggested that marketers should focus on advertisements' ideas which contain fun and entertaining elements to attract consumers and lead to consumers' favorable attitude toward advertisements. Pleasure element is also a motivation to consumers, and marketers should try their best to create a positive mood among consumers. For instance, create something new or something that consumers have never seen before so that this can lead to their positive attitude towards advertisements. Additionally, marketers can include funny elements into the advertisements to attract the consumers and ultimately form consumers' positive attitude toward advertisements as well.

*Irritation* If consumers feel irritated, they will just ignore the advertisements. As a consequence, this will lead to consumers' negative attitude toward advertising. As the consumers nowadays have control over some advertisements, they can choose when and where they want to be exposed to the advertisements. They can even decide what contents they want to be exposed to. So it is suggested that marketers expose the advertisements to the right target consumers at the right time and at the right place through the right media. The contents of the advertisements should be put into consideration by the marketers and managers so that the consumers won't feel irritated and hence ignore the advertisements.

*Personalization* The finding of this study revealed that this has no significant influence on consumers' attitude toward print advertising. Therefore marketers should focus on other elements in the advertisements which could lead to consumers' positive attitude toward print advertisements.

Credibility Marketers and managers of the company should choose the right person to deliver the advertising messages so that it could create credibility and trustworthiness among consumers. For instance choose professionals and experts because consumers tend to believe what the professionals and experts say. Besides, marketers should also build good brand and company reputation. If consumers have a favorable perception of the organizations, they will be likely to have a positive attitude toward advertising because they will perceive the organizations' products and services positively.

Attitude It is suggested that marketers focus on ways to form positive attitudes of consumers toward print advertising. If consumers are interested in the print advertising, they will start to look for more information regarding the products and services, which will ultimately lead to their behavioral intention.

# 7. Limitations and Future Research

There were a few limitations in this study. The first limitation was related to the language used in questionnaires. There was only one language, English, used in the questionnaires. Researcher found difficulty collecting data from the locals who were not English-literate. Besides, the research data were collected from the respondents from some of the states in Malaysia but not all the states in Malaysia i.e. Kelantan, Johor, etc. Since the sample of research was taken from some of the states in Malaysia, it could only reflect the consumers' perception in those particular states instead of all Malaysian consumers. It was possible that the results of the interrelationship among the studied variables and the relative importance of variables were highly affected by the standard of living, lifestyle,

education level and cultural factors in those states. Moreover, there were some other potential variables that might lead to the development of consumers' attitude and behavioral intention towards print advertising apart from the variables studied in this study. Besides the product information, social role and image, hedonic/pleasure, irritation, personalization, and credibility dimensions, there may be other potential factors that play a part in the formation of consumers' attitude and behavioral intention towards print advertising.

This study suggests that researchers should conduct the questionnaire survey in different languages to cater for more respondents as well as to deduct the time consumed from having to explain the questions to some of the respondents. Other languages such as Bahasa Malaysia could be used in the questionnaires in order to ensure the respondents truly understand the situation in order to ensure the reliability of answers given. Moreover, this study also recommends that future researchers collect and ensure that the data are from all the states and Federal Territories of Malaysia. Furthermore, researchers could conduct the future studies by collaborating with the companies or marketing agencies so that it could reach more companies' customers because the customers are the ones who buy the companies' products and they understand what they want as consumers. This could enable researchers to achieve the reliability of the respondents where respondents are able to respond truthfully reflecting their real needs.

Last but not least, future research should examine other factors which influence consumers' attitude and behavioral intention towards print advertising such as perceived usefulness, ubiquity, frequency, etc. Further research should explore other important factors that were not included in this study in order to get more findings to help marketers to market their company's products and services to the consumers and increase companies' profits. Researchers could also do some studies on the consumers' attitude and behavioral intention toward other types of advertising rather than print advertising in the Malaysian context.

#### References

- Abd Aziz, N., & Ariffin, A. A. M. (2010). Exploring consumer attitude towards web advertising and its influence on web ad usage in Malaysia. *Journal of Management*, 31, 55-63.
- Abd Aziz, N., Mohd Yasin, N., & Syed A. Kadir, B. S. L. (2008). Web advertising beliefs and attitude: Internet users' view. *The Business Review*, 9(2), 337.
- Abdul Azeem & Zia ul Haq. (2012). Perception towards internet advertising: a study with reference to three different demographic groups. *Global Business and Management Research: An International Journal*, 4(1), 28-45.
- Adler, R. B., & Rodman, G. R. (2009). *Understanding human communication* (10th ed.). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Ajzen, I. (1991). The theory of planned behavior. *Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Processes*, 50(2), 179-211. https://doi.org/10.1016/0749-5978(91)90020-T
- Alden, D., Mukherjee, A., & Hoyer, W. D. (2000). The effects of incongruity, surprise and positive moderators on perceived humor in television advertising. *Journal of Advertising*, 29(2), 1-15. https://doi.org/10.1080/00913367.2000.10673605
- Altuna, O. K., & Konuk, F. A. (2009). Understanding consumer attitudes toward mobile advertising and its impact on consumers' behavioral intentions: A cross-market comparison of United States and Turkish consumers. *International Journal of Mobile Marketing*, 4(2), 43-51.
- Anderson, J. A., & Meyer, T. P. (1975). Functionalism and the mass media. *Journal of Broadcasting*, *19*, 11-22. https://doi.org/10.1080/08838157509363766
- Aydin, G. (2016). Attitude towards digital advertisements: Testing differences between social media ads and mobile ads. *International Journal of Research in Business Studies and Management*, 3(2), 1-11.
- Babin, B. J., Darden, W. R., & Griffin, M. (1994). Work and/or fun: Measuring hedonic and utilitarian shopping value. *The Journal of Consumer Research*, 20(4), 644-656. https://doi.org/10.1086/209376
- Bagozzi, R. P. (1981). Attitudes, Intentions and Behavior: A test of some key hypotheses. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 41(4), 607-627. https://doi.org/10.1037/0022-3514.41.4.607
- Balasubramanian, S., Peterson, R. A., & Jarvenpaa, S. L. (2002). Exploring the implications of m-commerce for markets and marketing. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 30(4), 348-361. https://doi.org/10.1177/009207002236910
- Barkus, L., & Dey, A. (2003). Location-based services for mobile telephony: A study of users' privacy concerns.

- Proceedings of the INTERACT 2003 9TH IFIP TC13 International Conference on Human-Computer Interaction, Intel Berkeley Research.
- Bauer, R. A., & Greyser, S. A. (1968). *Advertising in America: The consumer view.* Unpublished Graduate Dissertation, Boston, MA: Harvard University.
- Belch, G. E., & Belch, M. A. (2011). *Advertising and Promotion: An Integrated Marketing Communications Perspective* (9th ed.). New York: McGraw Hill Higher Education.
- Belk, R. W. (1985). Materialism: Trait aspects of living in the material world. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 12(3), 265-280. https://doi.org/10.1086/208515
- Blas, S. S., Mafé, C. R., & Parreño, J. M. (2015). Message-driven factors influencing opening and forwarding of mobile advertising messages. *International Journal of MobileCommunications*, 13(4), 339. https://doi.org/10.1504/IJMC.2015.070058
- Brackett, L. K., & Carr, B. N. (2001). Cyberspace advertising vs. other media: Consumer vs. mature student attitude. *Journal of Advertising Research*, 41(5), 23-32. https://doi.org/10.2501/JAR-41-5-23-32
- Briggs, R., & Hollis, N. (1997). On the web: Is there response before click through? *Journal of Advertising Research*, 2, 33-45.
- Brown, S. P., & Stayman, D. M. (1992). Antecedents and consequences of attitude toward the ad: A meta-analysis. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 19, 35-49. https://doi.org/10.1086/209284
- Bush, A. J., Smith, R., & Martin, C. (1999). The Influence of consumer socialization variables on attitude toward advertising: A Comparison of African-American and Caucasians. *Journal of Advertising*, 28(3), 13-24. https://doi.org/10.1080/00913367.1999.10673586
- Cal, B., & Adams, R. (2014). The effect of hedonistic and utilitarian consumer behavior on brand equity: Turkey UK comparison on Coca Cola. *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences, 150*, 475-484. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.09.057
- Carroll, A., Barnes, S. J., Scornavacca, E., & Fletcher, K. (2007). Consumer perceptions and attitude toward SMS advertising: Recent evidence from New Zealand. *International Journal of Advertising*, 26(1), 79-98. https://doi.org/10.1080/02650487.2007.11072997
- Castells, M., Fernandez-Ardevol, M., Qiu, J., & Sey, A. (2006). *Mobile Communication and Society. A Global Perspective*. Cambridge: MIT Press.
- Chaiken, S. (1987). The heuristic model of persuasion. In M. P. Zanna, J. M. Olson, & C. P. Herman (Eds.), *Social influence: The Ontario Symposium* (Vol. 5, pp. 3-39). Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Chatterjee, A., & Hunt, J. M. (1996). Self-monitoring as a personality correlate of materialism: An investigation of related cognitive orientation. *Psychological Reports*, 79, 523-528. https://doi.org/10.2466/pr0.1996.79.2.523
- Chen, Q., & Wells, W. D. (1999). Attitude toward the site. Journal of Advertising Research, 39(5), 27-37.
- Childers, T. L., & Houston, M. J. (1984). Condition for a picture-superiority effect on consumer memory. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 11(2), 643-654. https://doi.org/10.1086/209001
- Chiu, C-Y., & Leung, A. K-Y. (2007). *Do multicultural experiences make people more creative? If so, how?*Retrieved January 3, 2008, from http://www.in-mind.org/special-issue/do-multicultural-experiencesmake-people-more-creative-if-so.html
- Christopher, A. N., & Sclenker, B. R. (2000). The impact of perceived material wealth and perceiver personality on first impressions. *Journal of Economic Psychology*, 21, 1-19. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0167-4870(99)00033-1
- D'Souza, C., & Taghian, M. (2005). Green advertising effects on attitude and choice of Advertising themes. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 17(3), 51-66. https://doi.org/10.1108/13555850510672386
- Davis, F. D. (1989). Perceived usefulness, perceived ease of use, and user acceptance of information technology. *MIS Quarterly, 13*(3), 319-340. https://doi.org/10.2307/249008
- Davis, F. D., Bagozzi, R. P., & Warshaw, P. R. (1992). Extrinsic and intrinsic motivation to use computers in the workplace. *Journal of Applied Social Psychology*, 22, 1111-1132. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1559-1816.1992.tb00945.x

- Desai, P., & Patel, N. (2014). The role of print advertising during product recall crisis. *Innovare Journal of Business Management*, 2(1), 6-11.
- Doyle, P. (1997). Signals of vulnerability in agency-client relations. *Journal of Marketing*, 44(4), 18-23. https://doi.org/10.2307/1251225
- Ducoffe, R. H. (1995). How consumers assess the value of advertising. *Journal of Current Issues and Research in Advertising*, 17(1), 1-18. https://doi.org/10.1080/10641734.1995.10505022
- Ducoffe, R. H. (1996). Advertising value and advertising on the Web. *Journal of Advertising Research*, 36(5), 21-35.
- Dutta-Bergman, M. J. (2006). Community participation and Internet use after September 11: Complementarity in channel consumption. *Journal of Computer-Mediated Communication*, 11, 469-484. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1083-6101.2006.00022.x
- Edell, J. A., & Burke, M. C. (1987). The power of feelings in understanding advertising effects. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 14(3), 421-433. https://doi.org/10.1086/209124
- Eze, U. C., & Lee, C. H. (2012). Consumers' attitude towards advertising. *International Journal of Business and Management*, 7(13), 94-108. https://doi.org/10.5539/ijbm.v7n13p94
- Fishbein, M. (1967). Readings in attitude theory and measurement. New York: John Wiley.
- Fishbein, M., & Ajzen, I. (1975). *Belief, Attitude, Intention, and Behavior: An Introduction to Theory and Research Reading.* MA: Addison-Wesley
- Fishbein, M., & Ajzen, I. (2005). *Predicting and changing behavior: The reasoned action approach*. New York: Tylor & Francis.
- Fitzmaurice, J., & Comegys, C. (2006). Materialism and social consumptions. *Journal of Marketing Theory and Practice*, *14*(4), 287-299. https://doi.org/10.2753/MTP1069-6679140403
- Fornell, C., & Larcker, D. F. (1981). Evaluating structural equation models with unobservable variables and measurement error. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 39-50. https://doi.org/10.2307/3151312
- Fournier, S., & Richins, M. L. (1991). Some theoretical and popular notions concerning materialism. *Journal of Social Behavior and Personality*, 6(6), 403-413.
- Fred, R. (2003). The marketing of 3G. *Marketing Intelligence & Planning*, 21(6), 370-378, https://doi.org/10.1108/02634500310499239
- Global Media Report 2015. (n.d.). Retrieved September 20, 2017, from http://www.mckinsey.com/industries/media-and-entertainment/our-insights/global-media-report-2015
- Goldsmith, R. E., & Lafferty, B. A. (2002). Consumer response to websites & their influence on advertising effectiveness. *Journal of Electronic Networking Application and Policy*, 12(4), 318-328. https://doi.org/10.1108/10662240210438407
- Goldsmith, R. E., Lafferty, B. A., & Newell, S. J. (2000). The impact of corporate credibility and celebrity credibility on consumer reaction to advertisements and brands. *Journal of Advertising*, 29(3), 43-54. https://doi.org/10.1080/00913367.2000.10673616
- Griffin, G. (2006). Charge your advertising with excitement. Instant and Small Commercial Printer, 25(5), 6-9.
- Griffin, R. W., & O'Leary-Kelly, A. M. (2006). The Dark Side of Organizational Behavior. New York: Wiley.
- Haghirin, P., Modlberger, M., & Tanuskova, A. (2005). Increasing advertising value of mobile marketing: An empirical study of antecedent. *International Conferences on System Sciences*, 1, 32. https://doi.org/10.1109/HICSS.2005.311
- Hair, J. F., Babin, B., Money, A. H., & Sanouel, P. (2011). *Essential of business research methods* (2nd ed.). Armonk, NY: M. E. Sharpe, Inc.
- Hair, J. F., Black, W. C., & Babin, B. J. (2010). *Multivariate data analysis: A global perspective*. Upper Saddle River: Prentice Hall.
- Hair, J. F., Ringle, C. M., & Sarstedt, M. (2013). Partial least squares structural equation modeling: Rigorous applications, better results and higher acceptance. *Long Range Planning*, 46(1-2), 1-12. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lrp.2013.01.001
- Hair, J. F., Tatham, R. L., Anderson, R. E., & Black, W. (1998). Multivariate data analysis (5th ed.). Pearson.

- Haller, T. F. (1974). What students think of advertising. Journal of Advertising Research, 14, 33-38.
- Harvey, D. (2006). Neo-liberalism as creative destruction. *Geogr. Ann*, 88B(2), 145-158. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0435-3684.2006.00211.x
- Hoffman, D. C., & Novak, T. P. (1996). Marketing in hypermedia computer mediated environment: Conceptual foundations. *Journal of Marketing*, 60, 50-68. https://doi.org/10.2307/1251841
- Jacoby, J., Szybillo, G. J., & Busato-Schach, J. (1977). Information acquisition behavior in brand choice situations. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 3(4), 209-216. https://doi.org/10.1086/208669
- James, W. L., & Kover, A. (1992). Do overall attitude toward advertising affect involvements with specific advertisements?. *Journal of Advertising Research*, 32(5), 78-83.
- Javid, M. H., Namin, A. T., & Noorai, M. (2012). Prioritization of factors affecting consumers' attitude toward mobile advertising. *Journal of Basic and Applied*, 2(9), 9293-9300.
- Karjaluoto, H., Lehto, H., Leppaniemi, M., & Jayawardhena, C. (2008a). Exploring gender influence on customer's intention to engage permission-based mobile marketing. *Electronic Markets*, *18*(3), 242-259. https://doi.org/10.1080/10196780802265793
- Karjaluoto, H., Standing, C., Becker, M., & Leppaniemi, M. (2008b). Factors affecting Finnish conumers' intention to receive sms marketing: A conceptual model and an empirical study. *International Journal of Electronic Business*, 6(3), 298-318. https://doi.org/10.1504/IJEB.2008.019109
- Karson, E. J., McCloy, S. D., & Bonner, G. P. (2006). An examination of consumers' attitudes and beliefs towards Web Site Advertising. *Journal of Current Issues and Research in Advertising*, 28(2), 77-91. https://doi.org/10.1080/10641734.2006.10505200
- Katterbach, W. (2002). Die SMS-verkäufer. Impulse, 1st February, 76.
- Katz, E., & Feldman, J. J. (1973). The Kennedy-Nixon Debates: A survey of surveys. *Studies in Public Communication*, 4, 127-163.
- Katz, E., & Parness, P. (1975). Remembering the news: What the picture adds to recall. *Journalism Quarterly*, *54*, 231-239. https://doi.org/10.1177/107769907705400201
- Katz, E., Blumler, J. G., & Gurevitch, M. (1974). Uses and gratifications research. *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 37(4), 509-524. https://doi.org/10.1086/268109
- Keller, K. L. (1993). Conceptualizing, measuring, and managing customer-based brand equity. *Journal of Marketing*, *57*(1), 1-22. https://doi.org/10.2307/1252054
- Klapdor, S. (2013). Effectiveness of Online Marketing Campaigns: An Investigation into Online Multichannel and Search Engine Advertising. Wiesbaden: Springer Gabler. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-658-01732-3
- Kola & Akinyele. (2010). Evaluation of effectiveness of marketing communication mix element in Nigerian service sector.
- Korgaonkar, P., & Wolin, L. (2002). Web usage, advertising, and shopping: Relationship patterns. *Internet Research: Electronic Networking Applications and Policy, 12*(2), 191-204. https://doi.org/10.1108/10662240210422549
- Kotler, P. (2000). Marketing management. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Kotler, P., & Keller, L. K. (2008). Marketing Management (12th ed.). Prentice Hall, Inc.
- Krishnan, H. S., & Chakravati, D. (2003). A process analysis of the effects of humorous advertising executions on brand claims memory. *Journal of Consumer Psychology*, *13*(3), 230-245. https://doi.org/10.1207/S15327663JCP1303\_05
- Kwek, C. L., Tan, H. P., & Lau, T. C. (2010). The determinants of consumers' attitude towards advertising. *Canadian Social Science*, *6*, 114-126.
- Lafferty, B., & Goldsmith, R. E. (1999). Corporate credibility's role in consumers' attitude and purchase intention when a high versus a low credibility endorser is used in the Ad. *Journal of Business Research*, 44, 109-116. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0148-2963(98)00002-2
- Lei, W., & Toncar, M. (2009). Examining beliefs and attitudes toward online advertising among Chinese Consumers. *Direct Marketing: An International Journal*, 3(1), 52-66. https://doi.org/10.1108/17505930910945732

- Leigh, J. H., & Gabel, T. G. (1992). Symbolic Interactionism: Its Effects on Consumer Behaviour and Implications for Marketing Strategy. *Journal of Services Marketing*, 6(3), 5-16. https://doi.org/10.1108/08876049210035881
- Ling, K. C., Chai, L. T., & Piew, T. H. (2010). The effects of shopping orientations, online trust and prior online purchase experience toward customers' online purchase intention. *International Business Research*, *3*(3), 63-70. https://doi.org/10.5539/ibr.v3n3p63
- Lutz, R. J. (1985). Affective and cognitive antecedents of attitude toward the ad: A conceptual framework. In L. F. Alwitt & A. A. Mitchell (Eds.), *Psychological Process and Advertising Effects: Theory Research and Application* (pp. 45-46). Hillsdale: Lawrance Erbaum Associates.
- MacKenzie, S. B., & Lutz, R. L. (1989). An empirical examination of the structural antecedents of attitude toward the ad in an advertising pretesting context. *Journal of Marketing*, 53, 48-65. https://doi.org/10.2307/1251413
- Malaysian Communications and Multimedia Commission. (2009). Advertising development in Malaysia. Retrieved April 12, 2014, from http://www.skmm.gov.my/skmmgovmy/files/attachments/Ad Dev Malaysia
- Maloney, J. C. (1994). The First 90 Years of Advertising Research. In E. M. Clark, T. C. Brock, & D. W. Stewart (Eds.), *Attention, Attitude, and Affect in Response to Advertising* (pp. 13-54). Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- McQuail, D. (1994). The rise of media of mass communication. In D. McQuail (Ed.), *Mass communication theory: An introduction* (pp. 1-29). London: Sage.
- Mehta, A. (2000). Advertising attitude and advertising effectiveness. *Journal of Advertising Research*, 40(3), 67-72. https://doi.org/10.2501/JAR-40-3-67-72
- Mequoda Tablet Study. (2013). How American Adults Consume Magazines on Tablets.
- Moschis, G. P., & Churchill, G. A. (1978). Consumer Socialization: A Theoretical and Empirical Analysis. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 15(4), 599. https://doi.org/10.2307/3150629
- Mullins, L. J. (2005). Management and organisational behavior (7th ed.). Prentice Hall, UK.
- Norris, V. (1984). The economic effects of advertising: a review of the literature. *Current issues and research in advertising*, 7, 134-139. https://doi.org/10.1080/01633392.1984.10505366
- Nysveen, H., & Breivik, E. (2005). The influence of media on advertising effectiveness: A comparison of internet, posters and radio. *International Journal of Market Research*, 47(4). https://doi.org/10.1177/147078530504700405
- O'Shaughnessy, J., & O'Shaughnessy, N. J. (2002). Marketing, the consumer society and hedonism. *European Journal of Marketing*, 36(5/6), 524-547. https://doi.org/10.1108/03090560210422871
- Okazaki, S. (2005). External search, content credibility and intrinsic gratifiers influencing attitude toward wireless ads. *Asia Pacific Advances in Consumer Research*, 6, 5-12.
- Osmonbekov, T., Gregory, B. T., Brown, W., & Xie, F. T. (2009). How consumer expertise moderates the relationship between materialism and attitude toward advertising. *Journal of Targeting, Measurement and Analysis for Marketing*, 17(4), 321-327. https://doi.org/10.1057/jt.2009.23
- Parreño, J. M., Sanz-Blas, S., Ruiz-Mafé, C., & Aldás-Manzano, J. (2013). Key factors of teenagers mobile advertising acceptance. *Industrial Management & Data Systems*, 113(5), 732-749. https://doi.org/10.1108/02635571311324179
- Pavlou, P. A., & Stewart, D. W. (2000). Measuring the effects and effectiveness of interactive advertising: A research agenda. *Journal of Interactive Advertising*, *I*(1), 61-77. https://doi.org/10.1080/15252019.2000.10722044
- Petty, R. E., & Cacioppo, J. T. (1986). *Communication and persuasion: Central and peripheral routes to attitude change.* New York: Springer/ Verlag. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4612-4964-1
- Podoshen, J. S., & Andrzejewski, S. A. (2012). An examination of the relationships between materialism, conspicuous consumption, impulse buying, and brand loyalty. *Journal of Marketing Theory and Practice*, 20, 319-334. https://doi.org/10.2753/MTP1069-6679200306
- Pollay, R. W., & Mittal, B. (1993). Here's the beef: Factors, determinants, and segments in consumer criticism of

- advertising. Journal of Marketing, 57(3), 99-114. https://doi.org/10.2307/1251857
- Preacher, K. J., & Hayes, A. F. (2004). SPSS and SAS procedures for estimating indirect effects in simple mediation models. *Behavior Research Methods, Instruments, & Computers, 36*(4), 717-731. https://doi.org/10.3758/BF03206553
- Preacher, K. J., & Hayes, A. F. (2008). Asymptotic and resampling strategies for assessing and comparing indirect effects in multiple mediator models. *Behavior Research Methods*, 40, 879-891. https://doi.org/10.3758/BRM.40.3.879
- Retie, R. (2001). An explanation of flow during Internet use. *Internet Research: Electronic Networking Applications and Policy, 11*, 103-113. https://doi.org/10.1108/10662240110695070
- Richards, M. R., Fields, H. W., Beck, F. M., Firestone, A. R., Walther, D. B., Rosenstiel, S., & Sacksteder, J. M. (2015). Contribution of malocclusion and female facial attractiveness to smile esthetics evaluated by eye tracking. *American Journal of Orthodontics and Dentofacial Orthopedics*, 147(4), 472-482. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ajodo.2014.12.016
- Robins, F. (2003). The marketing of 3G. *Marketing Intelligence & Planning*, 21(6), 370-378. https://doi.org/10.1108/02634500310499239
- Saadeghvaziri, F., & Seyedjavadain, S. (2011). Attitude toward advertising: Mobile advertising VS advertising-in-general. *European Journal of Economics, Financeand Administrative Sciences*, 28.
- Saadeghvaziri, F., Dehdashti, Z., & Askarabad, M. R. K. (2013). Web advertising: Assessing beliefs, attitude, purchase intention and behavioral responses. *Journal of Economic and Administrative Sciences*, 29(2), 99-112. https://doi.org/10.1108/JEAS-09-2013-0029
- Sallam, M. A. (2011). The Impact of source credibility on Saudi consumer's attitude toward print advertisement: The moderating role of brand familiarity. *International Journal of Marketing Studies*, *3*(4). https://doi.org/10.5539/ijms.v3n4p63
- Sangkhawasi, Thirarut, & Johri. (2007). Impact of status brand strategy on materialism in Thailand. *Journal of Consumer Marketing*, 24(5), 275-282. https://doi.org/10.1108/07363760710773094
- Sanz-Blas, S., Ruiz-Mafé, C., Martí-Parreño, J., & Hernández-Fernández, A. (2013). Assessing the influence of motivations and attitude on mobile social networking use. *Global Business Perspectives*, *1*(2), 164-179. https://doi.org/10.1007/s40196-012-0008-x
- Saunders, M., Lewis, P., & Thornhill, A. (2009). *Research Methods for Business Students* (5th ed.). Pearson Education Limited, Essex.
- Saunders, M., Lewis, P., & Thornhill, A. (2012). *Research Methods for Business Students* (6th ed.). London: Prentice Hall.
- Scharl, A., Dickinger, A., & Murphy, J. (2005). Diffusion and success factors of mobile marketing. *ElectronicCommerce Research and Applications*, 4(2), 159-173. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.elerap.2004.10.006
- Schiffman, L. G., & Kanuk, L. L. (2000). *Consumer behaviour* (7th ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson/Prentice Hall.
- Schlenker, B. R., & Leary, M. R. (1982). Social anxiety and self-presentation: A conceptualization model. *Psychological Bulletin*, *92*, 641-669. https://doi.org/10.1037/0033-2909.92.3.641
- Schlosser, A. E., Shavitt, S., & Kanfer. (1999). A survey of internet users' attitude toward Internet advertising. *Journal of Interactive Marketing*, 13(3), 34-54. https://doi.org/10.1002/(SICI)1520-6653(199922)13:3<34::AID-DIR3>3.0.CO;2-R
- Scornavacca, E., & Fletcher, K. (2007). Consumer perceptions and attitudes towards SMS advertising: recent evidence from New Zealand. *International Journal of Advertising*, 26(3), 225-236.
- Shavitt, S., Lowrey, P. M., & Haefner, J. E. (1998, July/ August). Public attitude toward advertising: More favorable than you might think. *Journal of Advertising Research*, 7-22.
- Shij, T. D., & Piron, F. (2002). Advertising agencies and advertisers perceptions of internet advertising. *International Journal of Advertising*, 21(3), 381-397. https://doi.org/10.1080/02650487.2002.11104938
- Siau, K., & Shen, Z. (2003). Building customer trusts in e-mail commerce. *Communications of the ACM, 46*(4), 91-94. https://doi.org/10.1145/641205.641211

- Solomon, M. R. (2009). *Consumer behavior: Buying, having, and being* (8th ed.). Upper Saddle River, N. J.: Pearson/Prentice Hall.
- Steiner, V., & Wakolbinger, F. (2012). Wage subsidies, work incentives, and the reform of the Austrian welfare system. *Empirica*, 40(2), 259-285. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10663-012-9191-x
- Sternthal, B., & Craig, C.S. (1982) Consumer Behavior. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- Stewart, D. W., & Pavlou, P. A. (2002). From consumer response to active consumer: Measuring the effectiveness of interactive media. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 30(4), 376-396. https://doi.org/10.1177/009207002236912
- Suggett, P. (2016). *Advertising Sweatshops Are a Huge Problem*. Retrieved from https://www.thebalance.com/the-problems-of-advertising-sweatshops-39287
- Sundar, S., Shyam, Narayan, S., Obregon, R., & Uppal, C. (1998). Does web advertising work? Memory for print vs. online media. *Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly*, 75(4), 822-835. https://doi.org/10.1177/107769909807500414
- Tavor, T. (2011). Online advertising development and their economic effectiveness. *Australian Journal of Business and Management Research*, 1(6), 121-133.
- Ting, H., & de Run, E. C. (2015). Attitude towards advertising: A young generation cohort's perspective. *Asian Journal of Business Research*, 5(1), 83-96. https://doi.org/10.14707/ajbr.150012
- Trigg, A. (2001). Veblen, Bourdieu, and conspicuous consumption. *Journal of Economic Issues*, *35*(1), 99-115. https://doi.org/10.1080/00213624.2001.11506342
- Troisi, J. D., Christopher, A. N., & Marek, P. (2007). Materialism and money spending disposition as predictors of economic and personality variables. *North American Journal of Psychology*, 8, 421-436.
- Tsang, M. M., Ho, S., & Liang, T. (2004). Consumer Attitudes Toward Mobile Advertising: An Empirical Study. *International Journal of Electronic Commerce*, 8(3), 65-78.
- Tsang, P. M., & Tse, S. (2005). A hedonic model for effective web marketing: an empirical examination. *Industrial Managerment and Data Systems, 105*, 1039-1052. https://doi.org/10.1108/02635570510624437
- Varshney, U. (2003). Mobile and Wireless Information Systems: Applications, Networks, and Research Problems. *Communications of the Association for Information Systems*, *12*(11).
- Waal, E. D., Schönbach, K., & Lauf, E. (2005). Online newspapers: A substitute or complement for print newspapers and other information channels? *Communication: The European Journal of Communication Research*, 30, 55-72.
- Wakolbinger, L. (September 2009). The Effectiveness of combining Online and Print Advertisement. *Advertising Research*, 49(3), 360-372. https://doi.org/10.2501/S0021849909090436
- Wang, J., & Wallendorf, M. (2006). Materialism, status signaling and product satisfaction. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 34(4), 494-505. https://doi.org/10.1177/0092070306289291
- Wang, Y., & Sun, S. (2010). Examining the role of beliefs and attitude in online advertising. *International Marketing Review*, 27(1), 87-107. https://doi.org/10.1108/02651331011020410
- Wang, Y., Sun, S., Lei, W., & Toncar, M. (2009). Examining beliefs and attitude toward online advertising among Chinese consumer. *Journal of International Direct Marketing*, 3(1), 52-66. https://doi.org/10.1108/17505930910945732
- Watson, J. J. (2003). The relationships of materialism to spending tendencies, saving and debt. *Journal of Economic Psychology*, 24(6), 723-739. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.joep.2003.06.001
- Watson, R., Berthon, P., Pitt, L., & Zinkhan, G. (2000). *Electronic commerce: the strategic perspective*. TX, USA: Dryden Fort Worth.
- Wiesel, T., Pauwels, K., & Arts, J. (2011). Practice prize paper—Marketing's profit impact: Quantifying online and off-line funnel progression. *Marketing Science*, 30(4), 604-611. https://doi.org/10.1287/mksc.1100.0612
- Wolin, L. D., Korgaonkar, P., & Lund, D. (2002). Beliefs, attitude and behavior towards web advertising. *International Journal of Advertising*, 21(1), 87-113. https://doi.org/10.1080/02650487.2002.11104918
- Xu, D. J. (2006-2007). The influence of personalization in affecting consumer attitude toward mobile advertising in China. *Journal of Computer Information Systems*, 47(2), 9-19.

- Xu, H., Dinev, T., Smith, H. J., & Hart, P. (2008). Examining the formation of individual's information privacy concerns: Toward an integrative view.
- Yaakop, A. Y., Hemsley-Brown, J., & Gilbert, D. C. (2011). Attitude towards advertising: Malaysians vs. Non-Malaysians. *Asian Journal of Business and Management Sciences*, 1(2), 77-94.
- Yan, K., Wang, S., & Wei, C. (2004). Personalized advertising recommend mechanism for the mobile user. *Journal of Applied Science*, 4(1), 118-125. https://doi.org/10.3923/jas.2004.118.125
- Zeng, Y. W., Wang, L. X., Pu, X. Y., Du. J., Yang, S. M., Liu, J. F., & Tai, L. M. (2009). The zonal characterization of elemental concentrations in brown rice of core collection for rice landrace in Yunnan province by ICP-AES. *Spectrosc. Spectr. Anal.*, 29, 1691-1695.
- Zhang, P., & Wang, C. (2005). *An empirical study on consumer's perceived value and attitude toward advertising*. Paper presented at the Global Information Technology and Management (GITM) World Conference, Anchorage, AK.

## Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author, with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).